

Evaluation of

**PLATFORM
PROGRAMME**

**Music as a Bridge
to Wellbeing**

January 2020



Christchurch Symphony Orchestra Platform Programme Evaluation
Hēmi Te Hēmi & Dr Lesley Campbell



© 2020 Ihi Research

ALL RIGHTS RESERVED. Any unauthorised copy, reprint or use of this material is prohibited. No part of this content may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording, or by any information storage and retrieval system without express written permission from Ihi Research.

Print and Design: Create Design Studio. www.createdesignstudio.co.nz

Acknowledgements

We are indebted to the Tū Ora (residents of Christchurch Men's Prison and programme participants), their whānau and the other respondents who participated in this evaluation and generously shared their experiences and views about the outcomes and success factors they associated with the implementation of the Christchurch Symphony Orchestra's Platform Programme. Your in-depth descriptions, deep understandings, thought provoking insights and candid reflections have been pivotal to writing the Platform Programme story. You have contributed to our further understanding about effective ways of using music to enhance wellbeing for the Tū Ora, for their families/whānau and for their communities.

Thank you to the Pathway Trust which forged connections with the Tū Ora, provided access to the Department of Correction's facilities and offered support and encouragement throughout the Platform Programme evaluation. We are grateful to the Department of Correction's staff for their willingness to allow our participant observation activities.

Tū Ora Description

Rather than describing participants on the Pathway Trust Navigate Initiative as inmates, the name 'Tū Ora' was presented by local iwi Ngāi Tahu, to be used instead. Tū Ora means someone who is upstanding and well or in a place of positive wellbeing.



“I want to thank everybody involved, especially everyone from the orchestra for coming here to help us, challenge us ... I relate it to food. Food brings a lot of people together and then after you eat it’s a nice feeling of fulfilment and that’s what music does for me. It has brought a lot of people together from different walks of life, different cultures and backgrounds and at the end of it they are all fulfilled with this different life. They’ve learned something new ... I want to encourage them to keep doing this. It’s a beautiful thing.”

(Extract from one of the group interviews with the Tū Ora)

Contents

Acknowledgments	1
Table of Contents	3
Executive summary	5
Introduction and context	7
Literature review	10
Introduction	11
Outcomes	11
<i>Long-term outcomes</i>	11
<i>Short-term and intermediate outcomes</i>	12
<i>Behaviour management and outcomes for prisons</i>	13
<i>Success factors contributing to outcomes</i>	14
<i>Building an empirically-based programme theory</i>	14
Findings	17
Background	18
Establishment	18
Designing and ongoing enhancements of the Platform Programme	20
Learnings from Community Engagement Programmes	20
Learnings from the Platform Programme facilitated in the Youth Unit	21
Design of the Platform Programme, August/September 2019	22
Learning about the Platform Programme	24
Engagement and persistence of the Tū Ora	24
Perceptions about the performance	25
Expectations	27
Personal goals and motivations	27
Outcomes	28
Outcomes for Tū Ora	28
Outcomes for whānau	35
Outcomes for CSO musicians	36
Outcomes for Christchurch Symphony Orchestra	37
Longer-term outcomes	37
Satisfaction	38
Success factors	39
Attributes and skills of the musicians	39
Approach	41
Opportunities for improvement	42
<i>Comments from the Tū Ora and their whānau</i>	43
Programme theory re-visited	44
Future opportunities	48

References	47
Appendices	56
Evaluation methodology	57
Evaluation purpose, objectives and key questions	57
Purpose	57
Objectives	57
Key questions	58
Evaluation design and approaches	59
<i>Case study design</i>	59
<i>Programme theory approach</i>	59
<i>Tikanga Māori approach</i>	59
<i>Participatory approach</i>	60
Evaluation methods and procedures	61
Procedures for data collection and analysis	61
<i>Synthesis of the literature</i>	61
<i>Developing a programme theory/logic model</i>	62
<i>The procedure for collecting and analysing the primary data</i>	62
Data analysis	63
<i>The procedure for collecting and analysing the secondary data</i>	63
Ethical considerations	63
Appendix 2: Additional quotes	65
List of tables	
Table 1: Objectives and key questions	
Table 2: Platform Programme August/September 2019	
Table 3: Enhanced whanaungatanga	
Table 4: Increased achievement motivation	
Table 5: Increased confidence	
Table 6: Increased social competence	
Table 7: Reduction of internalising problems	
Table 8: Reduced problematic externalising behaviours	
Table 9: Increased openness to wider learning	
Table 10: Transcending the prison routine	
Table 11: Increased skills and knowledge playing a musical instrument	
Table 12: Outcomes for CSO musicians	
List of Figures	
Figure 1: Programme Theory: Testing If ... Then Proposition	
Figure 2: Programme Theory Revisited: Respondents' views	

Executive summary

Symphony orchestras throughout the world are aspiring to remain relevant and accessible to the communities in which they reside. The Christchurch Symphony Orchestra (CSO) has embraced this trend holistically. The organisation's strategic vision is 'music for everyone' and its Community Engagement Programme has been designed to connect with people who might otherwise not have an experience with a symphony orchestra, in particular, connecting with groups that are under-represented in the community.

It is within the context of the CSO Community Engagement Programme that the Platform Programme emerged – a music-making programme delivered within a correctional setting. Rather than a programme that just teaches the Tū Ora to play an instrument, the purpose of the Platform Programme is to provide meaningful experiences that enhance the lives of the Tū Ora and offer a valuable set of skills to help them on their rehabilitation journey. The programme aims to be a platform to launch from and a stage for success and achievement.

While there have been some evaluations of music-making programmes within correctional settings, few have been developed in-depth. This evaluation intended to add to this evidence base by securing a baseline understanding of the contributory relationship between the activities and outcomes achieved for the participants and by adding to the knowledge about the success factors and future opportunities for development.

The evaluation findings showed a range of short and intermediate outcomes for the Tū Ora, their whānau, the CSO musicians and the CSO. For the Tū Ora the short-term outcomes included improved life effectiveness skills, reduction of internalising and externalising of problems, increased openness to further educational and vocational training, transcending the prison routine and enhanced musical skills. Those outcomes prioritised by the respondents included enhanced whanaungatanga, including the development of trusting relationships and teamwork; increased achievement motivation, and increased confidence. Intermediate outcomes included

an increased ability and confidence to deal with new and difficult situations, as well as fostering hope and strengthened relationships with whānau and peers and an increased ability to manage emotions.

Outcomes experienced by Tū Ora whānau included pride in the achievements of the Tū Ora which strengthened their relationships. Outcomes for the CSO musicians included increasing the accessibility of the CSO symphony orchestra; increased resilience, adaptability, quality of their artistic playing and an ability to raise awareness in the community about the stereotypes often associated with people in prison. For the CSO the achieved outcomes included enhanced relationships with their partners (Pathway Trust and the Department of Corrections); increased awareness of the Platform Programme amongst the CSO's stakeholders; and breaking down the stereotypes associated with symphony orchestra musicians.

These outcomes experienced by the Tū Ora, their whānau, the CSO musicians and the CSO addressed their personal goals and expectations for the Platform Programme. There was a high level of satisfaction with the delivery and outcomes achieved by the Platform Programme.

The outcomes achieved and the contributing factors in this evaluation are largely supported by previous research into the impact of music-making within a correctional setting. In fact, many of the immediate and intermediate outcomes reported in this evaluation have been shown to be steps towards successful community reintegration and reduced recidivism.

Recommendations

The findings presented in this report suggest the Platform Programme has a positive effect on the Tū Ora and their whānau, the CSO musicians and the CSO. It is recommended the elements of this programme that appear to contribute to the outcomes sought for the Tū Ora (and are supported by the empirical literature) should be retained including:

- Employing highly skilled and emotionally intelligent musicians to facilitate the Platform Programme.
- Employing theory-informed approaches to working with people in correctional settings including a scaffold-learning and activity-based approach; a participant-focused approach that is tailored to each person's preferred learning style; a strengths-based approach; and an adaptable approach.
- The partnerships formed with Pathway Trust and the Department of Corrections.

Other recommendations include:

- Ensure the goals for the Platform Programme and each of the sessions are clear to the Tū Ora and the musicians.
- Keep introducing new projects to the Platform Programme to maintain the interest of the musicians and the Tū Ora, including an opportunity for the Tū Ora to hear or play with the CSO symphony orchestra.
- To ensure the cultural safety of the participants, ensure there is an alignment between the tikanga Māori approach used by the Pathway Trust and the Department of Corrections and the approach used by the CSO, for example the format of the whakatau.
- Include a debriefing session with the Tū Ora after the completion of the Platform Programme to provide an opportunity for feedback and learning.
- Consider opportunities for further development of the Platform Programme including expanding the programme across different contexts within the correctional environment, including subsequent programmes that catered for the increased musical competence of the Tū Ora, as well as providing programmes following release.
- Use the theory of change model to demonstrate to stakeholders the elements of the Platform Programme that contribute to the outcomes, the

impact and why their support is necessary to ensure that it maximises its success.

- Evidence from this evaluation suggests that the Platform Programme promotes psychosocial change that may benefit the Tū Ora in the community. To establish the sustainability and transferable benefits of the Platform Programme for the Tū Ora following release, a longitudinal evaluation is required in which the Tū Ora are engaged in follow-up interviews in six and twelve-months' time.
- Additionally, to enable an investigation of the contribution of music-making interventions to the reintegration and rehabilitation of offenders, a controlled trial with one condition participating in criminogenic programmes alone and the other condition participating in a music-making intervention together with criminogenic programmes would assist with quantifying the additional benefits of incorporating the Platform Programme.

This work is part of a wider evaluation that is investigating the impact of the Christchurch Symphony Orchestra Community Engagement Programme.

Introduction & context

At an international level, orchestras are aspiring to remain relevant and accessible to their communities. Most orchestras are beginning to develop relationships with their communities. Through these relationships they are striving to co-create opportunities and deliver social outcomes to share their passion for music in diverse ways that are relevant and accessible to people who would not otherwise have access to orchestral musicians. Orchestras are no longer limited to delivering music from concert halls and are moving into their communities and delivering a range of education and community engagement programmes.

The Christchurch Symphony Orchestra (CSO) has embraced this trend holistically. Ihi Research is undertaking an evaluation of the implementation of Christchurch Symphony Orchestra's Platform Programme. This programme uses music as a platform to enhance people's social wellbeing and to facilitate positive social change for diverse community groups. The kaupapa (purpose) of the evaluation is to enable the Christchurch Symphony Orchestra to understand the outcomes the programme is having on diverse communities, the musicians involved and the wider Christchurch community. Evidence gathered through this evaluation will improve the programme by providing

evidence and feedback over the next two years (2019-2021).¹ The organisation's strategy includes a vision of 'music for everyone' and involves reaching diverse groups of people through two main avenues:

- Concert performances where the orchestra connects to different groups of people through a diverse range of concert series. Examples include the Masterworks Series in which the CSO shares the experience of great music, the CSO Presents Series in which the CSO collaborates with others to represent different musical genres, such as music with film, working with a band, working with a pop artist or working with theatre, and the Studio Series.
- Community Engagement Programme – designed to connect with people who might not have an experience with the CSO. In particular, the CSO has sought to engage with areas of high need and with groups that are under-represented in the community (Christchurch Symphony Orchestra, 2019). Over the coming year the CSO expects to facilitate over 100 projects and engage with 35,500 participants.

¹The methodology for this evaluation is located in the Appendix.

The CSO Chief Executive Officer noted the importance and integral nature of the CSO Engagement Programme to the organisation:

“Community engagement is one of the key things that will allow the art form of the orchestra to continue ... we need to embrace this change holistically. It goes right through the whole organisation and into the very nature of the role of every orchestral musician.”

The Community Engagement Programme includes a range of programmes:

- **Karawhiua!** Let’s Play! School Residency: A week-long programme with low-decile primary/intermediate schools.
- **Encounter:** Designed to provide opportunities to hear the CSO musicians perform incorporating Music Trails; CSO Encounters; Big Band concerts; Ambassador programmes; and lifestyle villages, rest homes and hospice recitals.
- **Flourish:** A programme delivered to people with early onset dementia in partnership with Dementia Canterbury.
- **Amplify:** Working with the disability sector on a range of projects.
- **Tune-Up:** A programme whereby the CSO musicians share their expertise with others to further develop their musical skills.

It is within the context of the CSO Engagement Programme that the Platform Programme emerged. In partnership with the Pathway Trust, the CSO has delivered three Platform Programmes within correctional facilities. The first programme was delivered in 2018. This was a week-long programme facilitated in the Christchurch Men’s Prison Youth Unit and culminated in a concert. The second and third Platform Programmes

were facilitated in 2019 in the community-run Navigate Initiative – an intensive pre-release reintegration unit within Christchurch Men’s Prison.² Rather than a programme that just teaches the Tū Ora to play an instrument, the Platform Programme intends to provide meaningful experiences that enhance the Tū Ora’s lives and offers a valuable set of skills (for example, cooperation, communication ... enjoyment of joining in and achieving something) to help participants on their rehabilitation journey.³

“The aim of this programme is to develop their personal skills; their ability to overcome fear of failure, to communicate constructively and support their colleagues, to learn more about each other through their shared experience, to control their frustrations and to concentrate for longer, to grow their self-confidence and to enable them to experience a buzz from achieving a quality performance.” (Christchurch Symphony Orchestra, 2019).

The name of the programme is intended to give inspiration to the Tū Ora – a platform from which to succeed. The projects that comprise the Platform Programme are designed to complement Tū Ora across the continuum of musical experience from no experience to considerable experience. Instruments that are easy to access are used creating an opportunity to teach whānau members after release. Platform Programme participants meet for a couple of hours each week over a period of eight-weeks working on various projects towards a performance at the end of the programme.

It is within the context of the CSO Engagement Programme that the CSO has commissioned Ihi Research to undertake an evaluation of the outcomes and success factors of the Platform Programme – a programme that offers Tū Ora in a correctional facility the opportunity for personal growth and to develop new skills through music.

The evaluation used a case study design accompanied by a number of approaches (programme theory;

²The first of its type in New Zealand, the Navigate Initiative is a pilot programme where up to 20 men at any one time spend six to twelve months prior to their release. The purpose is to intervene early and provide holistic reintegration support to prisoners that will improve their health and wellbeing, increase their connection with the community outside, provide them with skills and resources to enable them to seek meaningful employment and ultimately reduce the likelihood of reoffending after release (source: <https://www.pathway.org.nz/navigateinitiative/>).

³Tū Ora was a name gifted to the people participating in the Navigate Initiative by the local iwi, Ngāi Tahu. Tū Ora means someone who stands well or in a place of wellbeing.

tikanga Māori; participatory) tailored to match the context in which it took place. Multiple methods (participant observation; interviews; analysis of empirical and grey literature) were used to maximise the comprehensiveness of the data collected to answer the evaluation questions and to give credibility to the findings. Nineteen respondents were interviewed including representatives from the CSO, the Pathway Trust and the Department of Corrections, as well as the Tu Ora and their whānau.⁴ A full description of method can be found the appendices.



Photo 1: Final performance at Christchurch mens prisons

⁴Established in 1998, Pathway Trust delivers employment, accommodation and reintegration services that are supported by three social enterprises. In 2018 Pathway Trust introduced New Zealand's first community-run reintegration unit. This is an equal partnership between the community and the Department of Corrections to operate an intensive pre-release reintegration unit inside the Christchurch Men's Prison. (<https://www.pathway.org.nz/about/>).

Literature review

Introduction

The purpose of this review of the literature is to surface the empirical research findings about the outcomes achieved by music interventions implemented within correctional settings and the factors that have contributed to those outcomes.

In recent times there is a growing body of research that suggests that implementing arts programmes in criminal justice jurisdictions can result in individuals making positive steps toward rehabilitation and successful reintegration into the community following release (Miles & Clarke, 2006; Parkes & Bilby, 2010). While it is questionable that arts programmes will bring about successful rehabilitation and reintegration by themselves, they can contribute to short-term and intermediate outcomes that assist individuals with the change process and effective rehabilitation (Bilby et al., 2013; Tett et al., 2012).

Research has shown that positive outcomes can be achieved by arts programmes for those in prison, their whānau, the prison environment and society (Arts Education Partnership, 2004; Brewster, 2014; Daykin et al., 2008; Roverton, 2003). The underlying reason proposed for such positive outcomes for those in prison is the strong link between arts programmes and the development of the right brain. This results in superior thinking skills and greater emotional regulation. There is empirical evidence that suggests a well-developed right brain corresponds with increased focus, creativity, intellectual flexibility, patience, self-discipline and the ability to cooperate with others (Stevens, 2000; Sautter, 1994; Feder & Feder, 1981).

Various types of music interventions have been used in correctional jurisdictions for a number of years.⁵ Odell-Miller (1995; 2016) states that music programmes have the potential to enhance the quality of life for those in prison, bring about psycho-social changes for those in correctional institutions, reduce the rate of recidivism

and help with transition back to the community (De Nora, 2000). Dyakin et al., 2008 and others (Miles, 2004) write that while there are some evaluations of such programmes few have been examined in depth.

Outcomes

Long-term outcomes

Chen et al. (2016) note that demonstrating that music programmes reduce the rate of recidivism is challenging because such programmes operate in a larger eco-system of external forces that also influence this outcome. Rather, Chen et al. (2016) state that reducing the rate of recidivism should be considered a longer-term outcome and immediate and intermediate outcomes from music programmes should be regarded as early indicators of this outcome when a cause and effect relationship has been demonstrated.⁶

The long-term outcomes noted in the literature associated with music programmes include reducing recidivism,⁷ identity construction and increased social and cultural capital.

An evaluation study of the Diversion in Music Education Percussion Programme found that participants had a 9.09% recidivism rate six-months after completing the programme which dropped to 0% 12-months after completing the programme (Mathiti, 2002). Thaut (1989) found that music programmes address deficient thinking and paucity of empathy which are cognitive-behavioural factors known to be linked to offending behaviour. If affect modification is an intermediate step to behavioural change then this has the potential to reduce the rate of recidivism. Moreover, Stanley, (2009) and Keeler (2010) suggest combining cognitive-behavioural therapies with music programmes in order for these programmes to be more effective at reducing reoffending.

Music programmes have been linked to identity construction, particularly if a performance is part of

⁵The various types of music interventions used in correctional settings include live music, active music making, improvisation, song writing, music imagery, learning instruments, concerts with orchestras, rhythm, singing, bands and rapping.

⁶Long-term outcomes, known as impacts, refer to changes in the economic and/or social wellbeing of the target group. They usually take years and decades to achieve. Intermediate outcomes refer to changes in behaviour and usually take months or years to achieve. A programme has less control over both long-term and intermediate outcomes and therefore make a contribution to these outcomes. Short-term outcomes are the immediate effects of a programme and involve changes in skill, knowledge and attitudes. They occur within weeks or months of the programme and the programme is likely to have the most direct influence over such changes. Short-term outcomes and intermediate outcomes make a logical progression to long-term outcomes although they must remain within a reasonable influence of the programme and be accepted as valid by the programme's stakeholders.

⁷Balfour et al. (2019) suggest it may be better to link the outcomes of music programmes to desistance rather than reduced recidivism since there are many forces in place influencing a person to stop re-offending. Desistance is a four-staged process which people go through to become non-offenders. The process includes openness to change; exposure to hook for change; imagining a replacement self; and changing the way in which offending is viewed.

the programme and whānau and other stakeholders acknowledge the achievement and the new identity of the participants (Bottoms, et al., 2004; Daykin et al., 2017; Farrall & Caverley, 2006; Gude, 2009; Kamalanathan, 2016; Maruna, 2001, 2011; McNeil, 2006; Tett et al., 2012). The participants of music programmes achieve this outcome as a result of the programme fostering hope, motivation and responsibility as well as providing links to the community.

MacLauchlan et al. (2008) found that music programmes contribute to building social and cultural capital. Through the engagement of the music programme participants in a correctional environment, pro-social professional musicians facilitate participants to build social and cultural capital through the development of trusting relationships and social engagement.

Short-term and intermediate outcomes

Evidence suggests music programmes contribute to behavioural changes and desistance from crime for the participants. The findings from a UK study of a prison-based arts programme that mainly consisted of music projects found outcomes such as positive affect, social cohesion and relationships, engagement, achievement and the development of positive identities – all of which have been shown to underpin behaviour changes linked to reduced re-offending (Bilby et al., 2013).

The Good Vibrations Gamelan Project that used Indonesian percussion with participants resulted in emotional, psychological and behavioural changes that reduced the likelihood of offending (Caulfield et al., 2008; Wilson et al., 2009; Caulfield & Wilson, 2010). Similar outcomes were reported in the evaluation of Music in Time (de Viggiani, Mackintosh & Lang, 2010).

Short and intermediate outcomes were reported by the Changing Tunes research – a programme that uses music teaching, rehearsing, recording, performance, improvisation and composition with those in prison. The short-term outcomes included emotional energy, management of depression and anger and coping with imprisonment. The intermediate outcomes included increased confidence, increased creativity, increased employability and the development of positive identities (Maruna, 2010).

There are a number of immediate and intermediate outcomes reported in the literature about music

programmes delivered in prison. These outcomes include:

- Reduced anxiety and depression (Bittman et al., 2009; Chen et al., 2012, 2014; Gold et al., 2013; Wilson et al., 2008).
- Appropriate release of tension and stress (Chen, 2016; Coddling, 2002).
- Increased empathy – an outcome from music programmes that often include the participants sharing feelings and understandings and that offer social interaction that motivates empathy for peers (Chen et al., 2016; Martha, 2015; Staub, 1989; Wilson et al., 2008).
- Increased emotional control: increased emotional control and increased ability to self-regulate their behaviour was an outcome reported in a number of studies of musical programmes. This outcome is achieved because participants gain a sense of satisfaction from being involved in a creative process – satisfaction that comes from having the patience to gain control of an instrument (Brewster, 2014).
- Adopting a positive sense of identity, for example ceasing to see one's self as an offender and seeing one's self as a musician (Balfour, 2004; Maruna, 2003).
- Increased confidence, self-esteem and improved self-image by gaining a sense of their potential and their ability to achieve as well as experiencing the positive impact of the performance, including making their families proud (Balfour, 2004; Chen et al., 2014, 2016; Cohen, 2009; Cox and Gelsthorpe, 2008; Daykin et al., 2011; Daykin et al., 2017; Goodrich, 2004; Jermyn, 2001; Kamalanathan, 2016; Leith, 2014; Matarasso & Chell, 1998; Silber, 2005; Tett et al., 2012; Warfield, 2010).
- Improved communication skills, for example listening skills and an enhanced ability to express themselves, were enabled by the interaction with others that the music programmes provided (Cohen, 2009; McCue, 2010; Tett et al., 2012; Wilson et al., 2008).

- Working collaboratively: This outcome is enabled by working with highly skilled musicians who treated them with respect and working with their peers to prepare for the final performance (Tett et al., 2012).
- Building and maintaining relationships: Studies from New Zealand, the United Kingdom and North America show that participation in music programmes can improve relationships between prisoners, with the custodial staff and with their whānau (Boswell, Wedge & Price, 2004; Brewster, 2014; Chen, Leith & Gold, 2012; Compton-Dickinson, 2015; Palidofsky, 2010; Procter, 2011). A follow-up study of the Good Vibrations Gamelan programme found that a relationship of trust between staff and people in prison was sustained after six-months (Wilson et al., 2008). The participants in music programmes improved their relationships with whānau through telling them about the programme and demonstrating their achievements at the performance (Balfour, 2012; Warfield, 2010; Wilson et al., 2008).
- Research has found a strong correlation between participating in a music programme and taking up further educational or vocational programmes. The creative processes involved in playing music and participating in the performance develops the right brain, confidence and self-esteem all of which encourage the participants to take up new skills and learning (Anderson & Overy, 2010; Brewster, 2012, 2014; Cohen, 2009; Cox and Gelsthorpe, 2008; Hughes, 2005; Langeild, 2009; Siber, 2005; Tett et al., 2010; Wilson et al., 2008).
- Enhanced musical skills: Learning to play an instrument and playing in an orchestra allows the participants in a music programme to learn new skills they can use when they return to the community (Martha, 2015; Warfield, 2010).
- Preparation for release: Warfield (2010) found that music programmes prepare people in prison for release by providing a community-like context for decision-making, problem solving and building relationships. Brewster (1983, 2012) found that music programmes provide an opportunity for participants to reconnect with the community by performing music and this enabled relationships

with community people after release (Johnson, 2008, 107; O'Grady 2011; Schrift, 2006, 260-2; Tuastad & O'Grady, 2013). Warfield (2010) found that people in prison who learned to play an orchestral instrument used that skill when they were released.

Behaviour management and outcomes for prisons⁸

The literature has documented the detrimental effects of incarceration on people in prison (Cohen & Taylor, 1972; Crawley, 2004; Jewkes, 2005; Jewkes & Johnston, 2006; Liebling & Maruna 2005; Sapsford, 1983; Toch 1977). Music making in a correctional setting has been shown to reduce anxiety, stress, hostility and combativeness as well as reduce the mental frustrations of being in prison (Chen et al., 2016; Martha, 2015). Daveson and Edwards' Australian study of a women's prison programme where sessions involved sharing music material found that the participants experienced increased relaxation, reduced stress and increased self-expression (Daveson & Edwards, 2001).

Tett et al's., (2012) Scottish arts in prisons study found that many of the respondents stated that participation in a music project offered them a safe place to go in a relatively hostile environment and thereby increased their quality of life whilst they were in prison. Daykin et al., (2017) found music provided a distraction from being in custody and a relatively safe environment. Balfour (2012) found music programmes bridged the racial divide. He discovered that an unwritten rule in prison is that prisoners hang out with their own - defined by race. However, within the context of the music programme, people in prison were learning music beside people of different races – a first in their lives.

Since being in an isolated environment does not offer opportunity for social interaction, participating in a music programme allows people to interact with others constructively and deal with conflict appropriately (Chen et al., 2016). Moreover, Wilson et al. (2015) found that music making also enables participants to build positive relationships and trust and Smeijsters et al., (2011) found it helped develop coping skills and emotional regulation.

The evidence shows that music programmes reduce disciplinary problems and aggression in prisons (Brewster, 2014; Daykin et al., 2011). The Unit for Arts

⁸Behaviour management here refers to self-control and appropriate management of aggressive or self-harming behaviour and impulsivity (Coddling, 2002).

and Offenders (2003) found that of the inmates who participated in a music production 94% did not break the prison's rules during the programme – a 58% decrease in rule breaking compared to six-months prior to the programme.

An English study also found that correctional staff reported improvements in prisoners' attitudes to work, including an increased ability to occupy themselves in their cells (Hughes, 2005).

Success factors contributing to outcomes

Musicians: Research has found the success of music programmes is strongly mediated by the qualities, attitudes, skills and the reflexive awareness of the musicians⁹ (Chen et al., 2016; Daykin et al., 2017). They need to be highly skilled, have the ability to establish relationships with the participants based on rapport, mutual respect and cooperation, be flexible, adaptive and creative, and be able to establish an enjoyable and strengths-based process that enables an active learning model with the participants. In addition, musicians need to provide a balance between being responsive to the participants' interests and input and introducing unfamiliar music styles. Daykin et al. (2017) maintain that musicians who were the most successful were able to creatively incorporate the participants' ideas, lyrics and music that created some cathartic moments and some moving original pieces.

Design and approach: The second success factor reported in the literature included various aspects of the design and approach to delivering the music programme. Music programmes need to be informed by model-of-change theories (Chen, 2014). The musicians should hold high expectations and provide opportunities for the participants to succeed, focus on developing individuals at their own pace through working in small groups or on a one-to-one basis and use inclusive learning and teaching styles, for example including input from the participants. Daykin et al. (2017) advise that musicians bring participants into the activity as soon as possible and keep demonstrations short. Gold et al. (2013) report on the success of using a flexible process-orientated approach and Chen (2014) states it is essential to provide a safe environment. Providing the opportunity to incorporate a range of culturally specific techniques and musical genres is regarded as good practice (Chen et al., 2016).

There have been studies that compared the effectiveness of a range of music-related models (live, active music making, improvisation, song writing and music imagery). For example, Leith (2014) found that song writing emerged as the most effective method which participants used to address difficult times in their lives or to deliver messages to their whānau. However, Chen (2012) found no significant difference in the approaches. However, Chen (2014) did find the effects of the music increased as the number of sessions increased.

Offering the opportunity to perform has been found to have a positive effect on the outcomes experienced by participants in a music programme. Hughes (2005) and Tett et al. (2012) found that performances to the public have a strong impact on rehabilitation because they create a context in which the participants believe change is possible – a shift to a different lifestyle and a new identity as an artist. Moreover, performances provide an opportunity to share their achievement with family and friends (Wilson et al., 2008) and Leith (2014) found that such occasions seemed to provide the opportunity for whānau, who were dealing with their family members' offending, to increase their feeling of empathy for the participants.

Structure: Creating partnerships that provide an overall structure for the music programme is another success factor noted in the literature. Particularly establishing partnerships with community-based organisations and with staff from social and therapeutic services (Chen et al., 2016; MacArthur & Law, 1996; Stone et al., 1998). Having goals that are accepted by the music programme's stakeholders, enables focus, motivation and ownership for the programme (Daykin et al., 2017).

Building an empirically-based programme theory

A logic model, programme theory or theory of change is a graphic representation of an intervention that describes how it works to achieve the outcomes sought. Unlike experimental designs which focus on the long-term outcomes achieved by treatment and control groups, logic model designs focus mainly on the short-term outcomes over which a single music intervention has most control. Such theories of action make assumptions that if short and medium-term outcomes are achieved it is likely the intervention will contribute to longer-term outcomes such as reduced recidivism.

⁹Reflexive awareness is the ability to reflect the content and feeling of the participants' communications to validate them by conveying accurately an understanding of their communication. This, in turn, establishes rapport and the relationship.

There are several reasons for developing a logic model for music programmes including:

- It provides a framework for developing the questions for the evaluation respondents.
- It is flexible enough to include outcomes for multiple groups of people such as Tū Ora, whānau and CSO musicians.
- It permits some measurement of more intangible outcomes, for example measures of emotional change included in an outcome category such as enhanced psychological wellbeing.

Figure 1 draws on the empirical findings noted in the literature review to outline the short, medium and long-term outcomes of music programmes and the inputs and activities that appear to contribute to the achievement of such outcomes.



Programme Theory:

Testing if... then Proposition



Figure 1: Programme Theory: Testing if ... then Proposition

Findings

Background

The Christchurch Symphony Orchestra's Community Engagement Programme was established about 20-years ago with a small group of musicians visiting primary schools to perform for students.¹⁰ However, since the Canterbury Earthquake events of 2010 and 2011 and influenced by the international trend of "using the arts to connect with people" the CSO has further intensified and diversified its use of music and the knowledge and expertise of the musicians to connect with community groups. After visiting a number of international orchestras which were undertaking work in their communities,¹¹ attending a range of international and New Zealand conferences and talking to peers and communities the CSO has, more recently, devised a unique way of engaging with their community.

"It's unique and what we are doing now is uncharted territory. The point of difference from other orchestras is the way in which we are perceiving it strategically and organisationally ... it's in the musicians' contracts ... 50:50 performance and community engagement. It's us driving it ourselves and primarily by the musicians who drive the creative content and the participants who develop their own artistic content."
(stakeholder)

Rather than devising a programme and then implementing it, or teaching an instrument to people in a structured manner, the CSO takes a participant-driven approach to community engagement where the musicians draw on the creativity of the participants to create a deeper level of engagement and connection and ownership of the programme delivered.

The drivers for this growth in the range of initiatives that comprise the CSO Community Engagement Programme include:

- Wanting to enrich people's lives by sharing the power of music and sharing our passion for music.
- Wanting to facilitate access to the symphony

orchestra for groups within the community which, because of their circumstances, have limited or no access to an experience of this nature, have high need and are under-represented in society.

- Finding gaps in the community for musical input ... looking for what people are asking for and/or a demand for the CSO's involvement from community groups "people wanted us to do it".

The CSO Community Engagement Programme has a broad reach including Karawhiua! Let's Play! – a school residency programme; Encounter – an initiative that invites people to hear CSO ensembles perform; Flourish – an initiative that involves workshops with people with early onset dementia; Amplify – an initiative that involves people from the disability sector; Tune Up – a programme that enables the CSO musicians to share their expertise with others to build their musical skills; and Platform – an eight-week programme with offenders in a correctional facility that aims to develop a range of different music projects that are presented in a final concert.

According to the respondents, this reinvention of the orchestra and its place and relevance in the community, including the Community Engagement Programme, is now embedded in the culture and strategic direction of the orchestra.

"Community engagement is part and parcel of what we do. We are the orchestra of this city and community. We have a very unique role to play in that we're not just a musical organisation that pops in and out of the city. We're embedded in the community and that's where we wish to continue to be."
(stakeholder)

Establishment

The establishment of the Platform Programme occurred over time. Individually, members of the CSO came up with the idea of taking the orchestra into the prison environment and then gradually began to discuss

¹⁰In the early days of its implementation the CSO Community Engagement Programme was referred to as an outreach programme.

¹¹As part of her Winston Churchill Memorial Trust Fellowship, the current CEO visited a number of organisations in the North of England and Scotland including Opera North, Leeds; Royal Scottish National Orchestra, Glasgow; Halle Orchestra, Manchester, City of Birmingham Symphony Orchestra, Birmingham; Birmingham Opera, Birmingham; and the Birmingham Contemporary Music Group, Birmingham (Retrieved from: <https://www.communitymatters.govt.nz/assets/WCMT-FRR-PDF/Fellowship-Report-G-La-Roche.pdf>).

their ideas with their peers. At the same time Pathway Trust was looking for opportunities to collaborate with community organisations. A tipping point occurred as members of the CSO Senior Management Team were introduced to the Reintegration Manager of Pathway Trust who told them about the challenges confronting people leaving prison.

“I wondered whether there was some way a music programme could assist in the process of rehabilitation to make an easier transition for them, to help them realise that they have value too.” (stakeholder)

“ Always on the lookout for opportunities to develop a win-win relationship with organisations to help them engage with a group of people they otherwise wouldn’t engage with. (stakeholder)

As a result of this introduction, a collaboration was formed between the CSO and Pathway Trust in which both parties gained value. For the CSO, Pathway Trust helped them engage with the men who were in prison and provided an introduction to the prison staff. For Pathway Trust the CSO helped achieve some of their goals by providing a programme that enabled the men to bring meaning to their lives, learn how to learn, and demonstrate to the wider community that there is value and worth amongst the offenders.

“There is potential there. Look what happens when you invest in these people.” (stakeholder)

Sentiments of this nature are reflected in the programme name with ‘Platform’ suggesting the programme is something to launch from and a stage for success and achievement.

“Platform came about because it’s starting something. It’s actually what we can offer in the programme that will enable skills to emerge or give a sense of achievement.” (stakeholder)



Designing and ongoing enhancements of the Platform Programme

The first pilot Platform Programme held in the Youth Unit was a variant of the 'Karawhiua - Let's Play Programme' school residency that had received positive feedback since its inception. This programme worked with groups of participants culminating in a concert that demonstrated the skills the participants had learned. This concept was adapted for the Platform Programme to engage people in Corrections, relate to them, give them some skills and some form of sharing experience.

A number of design principles underpin the initial and ongoing development of the Platform Programme. These include:

- The programme needs to offer participants a meaningful experience that enhances their lives, for example using projects that anybody can do, such as participants teaching their whānau.
- Develop a relationship with an agency (Pathway Trust) which has an existing relationship with the Department of Corrections. This relationship facilitated the CSO musicians' introduction into the custodial environment including introductions to the custodial staff and provided a conduit to the Tū Ora to advise them what to expect as participants of the Platform Programme.
- Flexibility to include participants' suggestions and contributions to the programme; flexibility to accommodate participants varied experience with music; and flexibility to make a mistake and be supportive of that and help people when they need it.
- Creative: For example, changing the notation system of the Climate Song from a music to a word notation system to accommodate the learning needs of the participants.
- Stakeholder input: For example, before beginning the pilot Platform Programme in the Youth Unit the CSO musicians played for the Tū Ora and invited them to have input into the content of the programme. Feedback from the Youth Unit

participants, Department of Corrections and Pathway Trust staff informed the change from a one-week residency to weekly sessions over eight-weeks.

Learnings from Community Engagement Programmes

Lessons learned from other CSO Community Engagement Programmes were included in the design of the pilot Platform Programme implemented in the Youth Unit at Christchurch Men's Prison.

"Each time we did one of the programmes the musicians learned more and more about what worked and what didn't work." (stakeholder)

“ Each programme we do feeds into the one that follows. We take what has succeeded and what hasn't worked so well into the planning sessions. (stakeholder)

Some of the lessons learned at earlier Community Engagement Programmes included:

- Facilitating the musical programmes is not necessarily about teaching the participants to play a musical instrument or encouraging them to take up a career in music. Rather, it's about learning to think creatively and expressing ideas creatively.
- To work successfully with groups of people with varying musical experience it was important to have four musicians involved. This allowed those with considerable musical experience to be extended, and those who were struggling to be supported to enhance their musical skills.
- Learning the value of people, no matter what their circumstances.

"What you see on the outside might not necessarily reflect what's on the inside. Everybody has a voice that needs to be heard." (stakeholder)

“Appearances are not necessarily something you have to worry about.” (stakeholder)

- Do not single out individual participants in a group setting either through criticism or praise.

“If you gush about someone ... they feel pressured and exposed. Your praise has to match what the person is achieving to build confidence - but don't overdo it.”

- Develop the basic content of the programme (i.e. the creative projects) and then involve the participants from the beginning including incorporating their ideas.
- More explanation about why the CSO has chosen the projects to deliver.

“We need to explain the whole concept for each project. It feels like we focus on getting them to know what to do and perhaps not so much about the why they are doing what they are doing.” (stakeholder)

Learnings from the Platform Programme facilitated in the Youth Unit

The Platform Programme implemented in the Youth Unit at Christchurch Prison in 2018 was an intensive programme implemented over five-days culminating in a concert. The learnings from the Youth Unit experience included:

- Engaging the participants at the earliest opportunity to start building the relationships between the participants and the musicians.

“The guys came in and sat in a circle and they put up a wall of self-protection. Getting to know people is important. In the first session we now go around and shake each man's hand and try to learn their names.”

- Being organised and using a structured model of learning (scaffold learning) such as giving clear

instructions and having the building blocks for learning the music keep the participants engaged.

“There's a danger of them turning off and disappearing when things become vague and too difficult for them.” (stakeholder)

- Implementing efficient and creative methods of teaching that the participants would enjoy and learn quickly.

“Because the instruments are not available to the participants between sessions, we've had to come up with creative ways to teach them chords and strum patterns.” (stakeholder)

- Being more aware of the participants who are struggling and implementing strategies so they can be part of the practice or performance.

“Our experience is if you have enough stronger people then the ones who are struggling can just follow along. Music playing is so much easier when you are playing along.”¹² (stakeholder)

“Dividing the group so the chords played by each group overlap means you don't have to change over to the trickier chords quickly and the music won't stop.” (stakeholder)

- The fundamental role played by the partners of the CSO, Pathway Trust and Department of Corrections.
- Adjusting to the prison environment: The instruments that could be taken into the prison environment dictated what projects could be facilitated with the participants. For example, sound sampling and electronic music were unable to be used because of the Department of Corrections security measures. Participants learned to adjust their behaviours to accommodate the scheduled activities in the prison, for example arriving 10-minutes before they were due to start to avoid delays with the prison staff shift changes.

¹²Science has demonstrated that when people play music together the activity of their brain waves synchronises. Interbrain networks emerge when making music together. This means when a participant is playing music in a group the impulse to take action does not seem to come from one's own brain alone but rather seems to be controlled by the activity of the group (Sanger, Muller & Lindenberger, 2012).

Design of the Platform Programme

The design of the Platform Programme delivered to the Tū Ora in August/September 2019 is noted in the table to the right. There were eight 1½- 2 hour sessions with the duration depending on the energy and focus of the participants.

The respondents noted the programme had a tight/ loose structure. Tight in that there was a set of projects proposed at the beginning of the programme and loose by encouraging participants to explore their musical preferences and create lyrics and music that have meaning for them. In general, the programme was tailored to the competence, confidence and interests of the Tū Ora.

“The general structure is having a few projects and a performance event. We can always adapt the projects ... it seems terribly easy to add another one ... if they struggle then drop one ... depends on what the guys are interested in ... write a song project and only a couple of guys wrote one, but they really took to it so we developed music for that ... one guy wrote a song and we got the others to play the ukuleles with that, whereas one of the other guys wrote a more personal song and just two people played with him.” (stakeholder)

Respondents also noted the importance of developing trusting relationships with the Tū Ora, initially introducing themselves, their instruments, remembering names and beginning one of the projects to make a connection ... music provides the bridge; later talking informally before the session begins and taking a real interest in the music the Tū Ora know and love.

“We can’t find out too much about the people, ... maybe that’s special in that you’re relating to them in the present ... bringing in equipment from the car, we relate to each other in whatever way we can.” (stakeholder)

“They all took a special interest in the men as individuals. They picked up what the men were good at.” (whānau)

“ One of the men sang a waiata and then in week three, when the trust was built, he asked if we could include it in the concert. So, we bought in an extra guitar and the two men played together. (stakeholder)

The respondents noted the flexibility that was a key part of the programme – flexibility to support all the Tū Ora no matter where they were on the continuum of musical expertise; flexibility to include the Tū Ora’s musical preferences and creations; and flexibility to allow the Tū Ora to participate in a way that matches their interests.

“Just started slowly introducing them to the buckets, ukuleles ... introduce some of the chords and maybe a wee bit of music. It just grew over the weeks.” (stakeholder)

“Some people might need some sort of extension so we’re adapting all the time. Also, we’re not afraid of ditching something if it’s clear it’s not going to work.” (stakeholder)

“They come and go as they please ... one guy was interested in the drumming, so he came in for that and then ducked out ... he’s taking what he wants from it.” (stakeholder)

Overall, the respondents stated the CSO musicians wanted to meet the needs and interests of the Tū Ora.

“Debrief each session to agree on what projects need more work, when is the men’s concentration the highest, when are we ready to run through a piece.” (stakeholder)

“There’s an ongoing desire to evolve... The musicians wanted to do well so they’re always looking for ways to improve.” (stakeholder)

Platform Programme

August/September 2019

Platform Programme Session	Activities
Session 1	Demonstrate instruments (violin, viola, bass clarinet, percussion) and talk about them Start teaching one of the projects Start building relationships
Session 2	Working on 2-3 projects (e.g. drumming project; ukulele project; etc.)
Session 3	Introduce 'My Song,' the beginning of a song with the words at the start of each phrase written down with spaces for the men to add their own lyrics
Session 4	Experience playing a piece of music using an orchestral instrument (e.g. violin)
Session 5	Talking to the participants about what to expect in a performance Integrating the participants' contributions Running through the pieces to be played at the concert
Session 6	Talking to the participants about what to expect in a performance Integrating the participants' contributions Running through the pieces to be played at the concert
Session 7	Working through the performance, seating arrangements confirmed, etc.
Session 8	Concert performed including: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Climate Song - Six Months in a Leaky Boat, including the recorder - Songs/waiata played with the viola - Song/waiata written by one of the participants played to guitars - Song/waiata written by one of the participants and accompanied by ukuleles - Poem written and read by one of the participants ^{13 14}

Table 2: Platform Programme August/September 2019

Learning about the Platform Programme

As part of the Tū Ora's pre-release preparation the Navigate Initiative is run like a community. Participating in this community involves people choosing whether or not to engage in the programmes delivered by a range of community groups. The programmes that are available to the men include those the men have suggested and those suggested by the Pathway Trust. They include programmes that focus on relationships, parenting, fitness, cooking, barista training, cultural workshops, a barber workshop, a spiritual group, gardening, forklift driving, motivational speakers, budgeting and musicians from a band.¹⁵ Once a week at one of the community meetings, the Pathway Trust staff tell the Tū Ora about opportunities available and invite the men who are interested in participating to put their names down. Participation in workshops is voluntary.

"Pathway Trust staff talk about the different programmes and the Tū Ora select the ones that interest them." (stakeholder)

"They're in the reintegration phase so we (Pathway Trust staff) are wanting men to make decisions for themselves. Do you think you need this? Do you think you would benefit from this? You chose to participate." (stakeholder)

As well as being given information about the programmes on offer by the Pathway Trust staff, the Tū Ora also gain information from men who have completed the programme and men in the unit become interested after attending the concert.

Some of the respondents commented that Tū Ora would engage with an arts programme similar to the CSO Platform Programme as they have a craving for a creative outlet and the social interaction.

¹³The lyrics written by the Tū Ora are in the Appendix.

¹⁴When asked what there was about the project that appeared to have the most impact, the respondents were divided in their views. Some thought the bucket drums had the biggest impact; others believed the composition of the songs and poem had the biggest impact; and still others thought the viola accompaniment to the waiata was impactful.

¹⁵Each term the Pathway Trust staff prepare a schedule of the workshop opportunities available to the Tū Ora.

¹⁶To create the ideal learning environment, the CSO likes to work with between 8-12 men in each programme because this provides a 1:3 or 1:2 ratio of musicians to Tū Ora.

¹⁷The pilot Platform Programme held in the Youth Unit of Christchurch Prison had 12 men attend the intensive one-week programme. The first Platform Programme held in the Unit that housed the Navigate Initiative had nine men attend.

¹⁸The Tū Ora submit an application to enter the Navigate Initiative and are chosen by a selection panel.

"I expect they have very few creative outlets. A lot of their activities are work related ... work on the farm." (stakeholder)

The second Platform Programme (which is the subject of this evaluation) was initially attended by 12 Tū Ora.¹⁶ However, two Tū Ora decided to finish the programme early. One for health reasons and the other took up a release-to-work opportunity. The 10 Tū Ora consistently attended the eight-week Platform Programme.¹⁷

"Each week the attendance is good." (stakeholder)

"They stuck it out ... liked what they were experiencing." (whānau)

Of the Tū Ora demographic information, the men were between 24 and 57 years of age and identified as Māori, Pacific Peoples and New Zealand European. They all had a security classification of low or minimum and were in the reintegrative phase of their sentence having completed the rehabilitative programmes required by the Department of Corrections.¹⁸

Engagement and persistence of the Tū Ora

The CSO respondents were asked to describe the strategies they used to keep the men engaged throughout the programme and to keep them persisting when activities became difficult. The strategies included:

- Learning the Tū Ora's names.

"Learning all their names and pronouncing them correctly ... is important (because) it's a way of showing someone that they are important." (stakeholder)

- Chose interesting projects or instruments that sound reasonable quite quickly.
- Learning their preferred learning style.
- Engaging versus controlling teaching methods, for example being encouraging and using strengths-based language.

“Everybody is fiddling with their drumsticks, making a huge racket ... if you look carefully at the chaos those people are engaged ... chatting about the music, positive feelings, exploring some aspect of the music.” (stakeholder)

- Building muscle memory:¹⁹ An intense focus on a project or part of a project with multiple repetitions of songs to build confidence and competence; then have a break from the activity; and when the Tū Ora return to the activity they find it easier.
- Divide the Tū Ora into smaller groups to create a physical movement which breaks up the session.
- The four musicians alternating between leading a section of a session and being part of the group and working with the men on a one-to-one basis.
- Giving the control to the men to identify the projects they are most interested in doing or aspects of a project they are most worried about.

“... making sure they have input and agency when we are developing the songs ... What we do as musicians, is make the finished product the best it can be musically.” (stakeholder)

“The guy who wrote a rap, he had the chords and a little bit of a tune and so we (the CSO musicians) developed that using chord sequences that tend to work so the guys could play along with him.” (stakeholder)

- Music is fun.

“During the practices there’s a lot of laughter. There’s a lot of fun.” (stakeholder)

Strategies suggested by the CSO respondents for keeping the Tū Ora relentless in their efforts to learn the music included:

- Subtle ways to request help for the Tū Ora who seem to be having difficulties with some aspects of each project.

“Asking for help to do something again is easy with the team of musicians. We all feel comfortable just saying no, no. Let’s do it one more time or let’s do that a bit slower.” (stakeholder)

“At the beginning it’s quite fragmented and the Tū Ora cannot imagine what the whole song will sound like, so we play the whole thing through.” (stakeholder)

Perceptions about the performance

The respondents from the CSO, the Pathway Trust and the Department of Corrections views about the performance were framed in terms of the structure of the performance, the emotional characteristics of the performance and the achievements of the Tū Ora.

Of the structural elements, the respondents remarked on the great way Pathway Trust framed it with a pōwhiri at the start and kai at the end, the big and appreciative crowd that celebrated the Tū Ora’s achievements, and presenting certificates. They observed that music provides a bridge that connects us in so many ways.

“Celebration to share with others. We are a community ... doesn’t matter whether you are from the inside or the outside, we all belong to this group.” (stakeholder)

“The meaning of the certificates is that they’ve achieved something, and they’ve been acknowledged for that ... the appreciation they got from the clapping ... everybody liked it.” (stakeholder)

The respondents observed the emotional components of the performance –the excitement of the Tū Ora and the musicians and the pride felt by everyone in the audience.

¹⁹Muscle memory is a process in the brain that involves repeating an activity multiple times so the brain cements the action into its neural pathway so the activity becomes second nature (Krakauer & Shadmehr, 2006).

“There’s a different energy – an excited anticipation and nervousness - about a performance ... excitement but feeling this is mine, we know what we are doing, and we just do it. Then the pride afterwards of having done it. Performing is putting yourself out there. (stakeholder)

“Performance is an intensified experience ... real trial by fire and the pressures on and the nerves are in the air.” (stakeholder)

The respondents remarked on the musical skills the Tū Ora displayed, the leadership skills they demonstrated and the way their enjoyment of the music shone throughout the performance. The respondents believed the performance provided an opportunity for the Tū Ora to demonstrate they are valuable members of the Canterbury community.

“Guys knew they could do it ... had confidence ... were well prepared for it.” (stakeholder)

“Quality of what they had achieved in such a short time.” (whānau)

“Shows people what the guys are capable of ... raises the expectations about what the guys are capable of.” (stakeholder)

“Music became accessible ... men were a lot more in front of the performance; inclusive of the audience – a lot more playful.” (stakeholder)

The Tū Ora’s views about the performance reflected the way they approached it in a positive and confident manner and their pride in their achievements, including their display of leadership.

“Being prepared to turn up, take a risk and trust the teachers, our skills and each other.” (Tū Ora)

“Go in with a positive mindset and give it your best.” (Tū Ora)

“The first time many of the Tū Ora had performed ... really impressed with the level of their confidence.” (Tū Ora)

“It gives you something to work towards, it brings closure and a feeling of accomplishment. (Tū Ora)

The Tū Ora believed the CSO’s philosophy/kaupapa deinstitutionalises and normalises for them. They experienced the positive aspects of working as a team to create the items presented at the performance.

“Team having fun ... with the music ... that we’ve all created.” (Tū Ora)

Finally, the Tū Ora reflected that the performance provided them with the opportunity for their whānau and others to share in the celebration of their achievements.

“Perform for whānau so they can see him do well, persisting with my dream.” (Tū Ora)

“These types of events create a space where people view them in a positive way and give feedback on what they’ve done ... reinforces everything they’ve learned on the programme.” (Tū Ora)

The whānau’s views about the performance included pride and pleasure of seeing the Tū Ora having fun. For them the performance offered the opportunity to connect with and have a positive experience with their whānau.

“A shared experience for whānau to remember and connect about.” (whānau)

“Pleased to see him enjoying himself and doing what he’s good at.” (whānau)

Expectations

Three of the CSO and Tū Ora expectations were aligned. These aligned expectations comprised building competence and confidence to try something new and challenging; extending their musical skills; and an expectation of having fun and a positive experience. The CSO preferred not to be too prescriptive in the outcomes they hoped to achieve saying they genuinely didn't know what to expect.

“We were so green and had so much to learn ... we didn't have anything to compare it with.” (stakeholder)

“Overcoming the fear of trying something new.” Tū Ora

“Somebody who has not been exposed to experiences of trying something new will need to be encouraged to learn a new skill.” (stakeholder)

“To learn something new from highly skilled people in a safe environment.” (Tū Ora)

“To gain confidence in their musical skills.” (stakeholder)

“For people who couldn't play an instrument, to learn to play and perform.” (stakeholder)

The respondents agreed their expectations had been met and the Tū Ora had been provided with an opportunity to grow and learn in a safe environment and the experience had been positive for them.

The respondents from the CSO, the Pathway Trust and the Department of Corrections also suggested other expectations of the outcomes from participating in the Platform Programme.

These included:

- Increasing access to music for those who might not otherwise have the opportunity to connect with it.
- Forming a connection with people from the

community and gaining a sense of belonging.

- Take a holistic view of the programme's outcomes ... building a cooperative team.
- To be able to explore their inner creativity in a safe environment and to speak about things that are deeply emotional to them.
- For the Tū Ora to change their self-concept – a belief that they can be someone different - and for others to look at them differently.
- To have a sense of achievement.

Personal goals and motivations

Participants, the CSO musicians and the Tū Ora, were asked to think about their personal goals or motivations relating to the CSO Platform Programme with the following responses:

- To further enhance social justice matters in the prison environment.
- To bring music to people which has an impact on them.
- To surface the Tū Ora's innate capability for music.

“Music working as music does. It's in our DNA. You saw the verses the men came up with ... how deeply they had gone with those. That wouldn't have happened without the context of music.” (stakeholder)

- To give music to the Tū Ora to bring value and positive change to their lives.
- To have a hands-on experience and challenge of bringing music to the Tū Ora.
- To move out of my comfort zone by breaking the structured boundaries of an orchestral musician to become creative and improvise.

“The bucket drumming was quite a learning curve. Going from playing something that's really structured and written out to playing something where you just know the chords

and improvise from there ... an out-of-the-box kind of thing.” (stakeholder)

The Tū Ora motivations to participate in the CSO Platform Programme included:

- To take up the opportunity to do something different and learn to be adaptive.
- To learn to read music.
- To do something that would challenge me (as I've got no musical talent at all).
- To learn something new.
- To extend his musical and leadership skills.

Outcomes

The short-term outcomes (or immediate effects) of the CSO Platform Programme in the weeks and months after its completion were examined. Data was collected from the individual and group interviews and the observations conducted by the Community Researcher from Ihi Research.

Outcomes for Tū Ora

For ease of presentation, the findings concerning the short-term outcomes have been classified into a number of categories including:

- Improved life effectiveness skills, which includes social competence (i.e. building relationships/whanaungatanga, effective listening and communication skills, effective leadership, working cooperatively, reduced beliefs concerning stereotypes), intellectual flexibility/adaptability, self-confidence, achievement motivation and managing emotions (i.e. the release of emotions in a safe manner).
- Reduction of internalising problems, such as improved self-esteem, managing anxiety and fear,

increased emotional expression, developing trust and empathy and self-concept.²⁰

- Reduction of externalising problems, such as decreasing aggressive behaviour.²¹
- Greater levels of engagement and an increased openness to further educational and vocational programmes.
- Transcending from the prison routine (a way to forget about being in prison and simulate being in the community).
- Enhanced musical skill and knowledge.

Short-term outcomes reported by the respondents included outcomes in the improved life effectiveness skills category. The three outcomes most frequently mentioned by the respondents were enhanced whanaungatanga, increased achievement motivation and increased confidence.

The enhanced whanaungatanga outcome included building and/or restoring relationships with whānau, peers and members of the community, including the CSO musicians. All of the respondent groups and the participant observation researcher noted this outcome. A number of the respondents noted the stereotyped beliefs initially held by some of the Tū Ora and their whānau about the musicians.

“Elite and from a different community.” (stakeholder)

“People think the orchestra is terribly elite and a bit snobby.” (stakeholder)

Through building the relationships, these Tū Ora and their whānau realised the CSO musicians are normal people.

The most frequently noted short-term outcomes are noted in the tables below along with a selection of respondents' quotes.

²⁰Internalising problems include anxiety, depression and loneliness. They are also associated with unhelpful behavioural characteristics such as poor self-esteem and social withdrawal (Achenbach et al., 2016).

²¹Externalising problems are characterised by externalising behaviours towards the person's environment causing life functioning issues. Examples of externalising problems include domestic violence, social aggression and drug and alcohol problems (Krueger et al., 2005).

Enhanced whanaungatanga

Outcome	Respondents' comments
<p>Enhanced whanaungatanga/relationships</p>	<p><i>“The most enjoyable thing is learning something new and now I’m starting to make music and it makes sense. This is something I can teach my kids when I get home.”</i></p> <p><i>“One of the guys said he wanted to show his kids how to play the ukulele. It was important for him to share those skills.”</i></p> <p><i>“Reconnect with their families.”</i></p> <p><i>“Good for his son to see his dad up there in a leadership role ... good male role model.”</i></p> <p><i>“Belonging and connectedness.”</i></p> <p><i>“Developed a sense of the value of teamwork and trusting others, working with others.”</i></p> <p><i>“Supportive and sustainable relationships.”</i></p> <p><i>“Built new connections with the community.”</i></p>

Table 3: Enhanced whanaungatanga and respondents' quotes

Increasing achievement motivation is important in this context. One respondent explained:

“There has been very little to celebrate in their lives and they have very little to anchor themselves to any personal success ... (parents) think they’re screwups and will never come to anything ... that’s why they’ve got such low levels of confidence. They’d try something once or twice and then say, ‘it’s too hard I can’t do it’. By the end of the programme they were a lot more confident ... you could see that the certificate at the end meant a lot to them.” (stakeholder)

Learning to persist with learning a new skill even when they felt like quitting, was new to some of the Tū Ora. The CSO Platform Programme helped them increase their ability to motivate action. This behaviour is linked to wanting to learn and the ability to adapt.

Many of the Tū Ora felt proud of their achievements with the CSO Platform Programme. Research has found that experiencing pride because of a success can lead to people imagining further achievements (Fredrickson & Branigan, 2001).

Increased achievement motivation was noted by all the respondent groups and a selection of the comments from these groups is included in the following table.

Increased achievement motivation

Outcome	Respondents' comments
<p>Increased achievement motivation</p>	<p><i>"Increased purpose, meaning and hope."</i></p> <p><i>"Saw some of them when they finally got the rhythm or the chord, there was a real satisfaction."</i></p> <p><i>"Whatever the difficult thing is that you are trying to do and then when you get it, there's this wonderful moment afterwards when you're all on edge but you've got it and it feels great."</i></p> <p><i>"A sense of achievement and pride that they had something to say and people wanted to hear it."</i></p> <p><i>"Increased ability to persist."</i></p> <p><i>"Definitely showed me that if I try something new and I keep at it I'll get good at it."</i></p> <p><i>"Perseverance, sticking at it and knowing that even if I'm no good at it at the start, if I keep practicing, I will eventually get it."</i></p>

Table 4: Increased achievement motivation

The third most frequently noted short-term outcome for the Tū Ora was increased confidence. This outcome was particularly noted by the Tū Ora and their whānau. Table 5 includes some of the respondents' comments about this outcome.

Increased confidence

Outcome	Respondents' comments
<p>Increased confidence</p>	<p><i>"They had low levels of self-confidence at the beginning. They would try something one or two times and then say it was too hard. By the end of it they were standing taller ... more self-confidence."</i></p> <p><i>"Every session I became more open and willing to participate."</i></p> <p><i>"Confidence to try things that I can't do or that I'm not good at."</i></p> <p><i>"I felt more confident in playing these instruments because I was not the only one who didn't know how to play them."</i></p>

Table 5: Increased confidence

Of the life effectiveness skills category, various aspects of increased social competence were noted by the respondents as outcomes experienced by the Tū Ora after completing the CSO Platform Programme. The particular aspects noted by the respondents included: increased collaborative working; increased communication skills; increased leadership skills; increased intellectual flexibility/adaptability.

Of particular note is the increase in intellectual flexibility category noted by all the respondent groups. Increasing this skill enables people to adjust to change more readily and the creativity involved in playing music helps reduce anxiety, depression and stress.

Increased social competence

Outcome	Respondents' comments
Increased collaborative working	<p><i>"The camaraderie they get from working together is really important."</i></p> <p><i>"There's the camaraderie of working cooperatively."</i></p> <p><i>"Trust colleagues and promote working together."</i></p>
Increased communication skills	<p><i>"Listening skills got better ... picking up the different notes on the ukulele helped."</i></p> <p><i>"Learned to express myself in different ways."</i></p> <p><i>"They look you straight in the eye and will shake your hand. They're so polite and happy to chat."</i></p>
Increased leadership skills	<p><i>"Increased expression of leadership."</i></p>
Increased intellectual flexibility/adaptability	<p><i>"Courage to take risks."</i></p> <p><i>"Open mentally and emotionally to try new things."</i></p> <p><i>"I got out of my comfort zone and I did it."</i></p> <p><i>"He's made it through the uncomfortable bit of starting a new thing and now he's able to manage change."</i></p> <p><i>"Open to taking up new things."</i></p> <p><i>"The workshop has given me good focus and good concentration so that I can achieve."</i></p> <p><i>"Ah, I've got it now."</i></p> <p><i>"Awesome I've just learned a new chord."</i></p> <p><i>"An ability to express themselves or tap into their creativity through music."</i></p>

Table 6: Increased social competence

The only other life effectiveness skill noted by a small group of the respondents was an increased ability to manage emotions. A couple of the respondents' comments explain how managing emotions well can help the Tū Ora cope with some of life's challenges.

“Possibly an outlet ... when things are getting tough ... music can take you out of the space for a while.”

“The guys could have blown up at the performance. They increased their coping mechanisms. One guy said that this mechanism helped him at the Parole Board meeting.”

The second major category of short-term outcomes noted by a small number of the respondents was the reduction of internalising problems. This category includes increased self-esteem; increased emotional expression; increased ability to appropriate management of anxiety and fear; increased ability to develop trust and empathy and developing positive self-concept. The categories and respondents' comments are noted in Table 7.

Reduction in internalising problems

Outcome	Respondents' comments
Improved self-esteem	<i>“Increased his self-esteem.”</i>
Decreased anxiety and fear	<i>“Helped them manage anxiety.”</i>
Increased emotional expression	<i>“As a result of enjoying the programme he wrote in his diary that he promised his mum that he was going to do better.”</i> <i>“I was blown away by the insight the participants showed. A lot of personal expression.”</i>
Developed trust and empathy	<i>“Trust and be trusted.”</i>
Positive self-concept	<i>“From gangster and drug addict to musician.”</i> <i>“Belief that he will be different.”</i>
Increased ability to appropriately release tension and stress	<i>“Appropriate release of stress.”</i>

Table 7: Reduction in internalising problems

A reduction in externalising problems was the third major category of outcomes noted by the respondents who said through the programme they had learnt patience and this helped them control their anger.

Reduced problematic externalising behaviours

Outcome	Respondents' comments
Decreased aggressive behaviour	<i>"When you're learning as an adult you have higher expectations of yourself. It's very complicated and they ask why can't I do this ... they have to be very patient."</i>

Table 8: Reduced problematic externalising behaviours

A few of the respondents noted that participation in the programme had increased the Tū Ora's openness to take up further educational or vocational programmes. Part of this motivation was aided by three skills they had learnt while participating in the programme – skills that included an increased ability to focus; accepting it is all right to get things wrong and that one can learn from mistakes; and becoming more curious (an emotion that encourages people to desire to gain additional knowledge, skill and experiences).

Increased openness to wider learning

Outcome	Respondents' comments
Increased openness to wider learning	<i>"Eager to try something different ... the violins." "If I can learn these skills, then I can go out and learn other things."</i>

Table 9: Increased openness to wider learning

A few of the Tū Ora noted that an outcome for them was building a relationship with people from the community and participating in an activity that kept their focus in a way that made them feel they were out in the community.

Transcending the prison routine

Outcome	Respondents' comments
<p>Transcending the prison routine</p>	<p><i>"The chance to do something normal and work with normal people and talk with people just normally."</i></p> <p><i>"Great to interact with civilians and normal people as we move towards the gate on our journey."</i></p> <p><i>"The moment a person is focusing on learning a new skill with an instrument with people from the community, dressed in community clothes ... good as forgetting that you're in prison. This helps people reconnect to what it means to be a member of the community."</i></p>

Table 10: Transcending the prison routine

The final outcome of the CSO Platform Programme, noted by some of the Tū Ora, their whānau and the Pathway Trust staff, included furthering their skill in playing a musical instrument. This included increasing the musical skills of those who had no previous experience of music and those who were talented musicians.

Increasing skills and knowledge at playing a musical instrument

Outcome	Respondents' comments
<p>Increased skill playing a musical instrument</p>	<p><i>"People who couldn't play buckets and ukuleles, learned to play them." (stakeholder)</i></p>
<p>Furthering musical talents</p>	<p><i>"Hearing the CSO play motivated me to pick up an instrument."</i></p>

Table 11: Increasing skills and knowledge at playing a musical instrument

Outcomes for whānau

The three main outcomes experienced by whānau included pride in the achievements by Tū Ora; relationship building, and stereotypes being broken down.

Comments from respondents noted below reflect pride in the achievements of their whānau member and the joy at seeing them having fun within a prison environment.

“Their whānau saw them doing something well and that something good came out of their time in prison.” (stakeholder)

“Enjoyed the performance because they saw the guys having fun.” (stakeholder)

“There are so many reasons not to be proud of your men and so to find a reason to be proud is really important.” (stakeholder)

“Emotional that they had completed the programme ... proud.” (whānau)

“I never knew he had those sorts of talents.” (whānau)

Having the opportunity to come and see the Tū Ora at the performance helped to further build the relationships.

“Build healthy relationships with whānau.” (whānau)

“Lovely that they had the opportunity to come and see him.” (stakeholder)

One whānau member changed her perceptions of orchestral musicians.

“I thought artists were temperamental, but the musicians are so lovely.” (whānau)

Finally, the whānau experienced the performance as though it was in a community setting – an occasion that enabled them to forget their whānau member was in prison.

“At one point (Tū Ora) came and sat between us at the table ... felt like real life and not separate from us like in the prison ... We were all part of the audience.” (whānau)

“It was like being in a normal life setting with normal people.” (whānau)



Photo 2: CSO Musician with Tū Ora participants.

Outcomes for CSO musicians

Respondents observed a range of outcomes for the CSO musicians. These are recorded in Table 12. The CSO musicians who participated in the Platform Programme provided the following comments:

Outcomes for CSO musicians

Outcome	Respondents' comments
Increase accessibility of orchestra	<i>"A lot of people associate the orchestra with fancy concert halls, expensive tickets and dressed up in tails. It's nice to be able to do a lot of other things to make us more accessible."</i>
Satisfaction	<i>"Satisfaction from shaping the programme and sharing knowledge and skills and the ability to cooperate."</i>
Increased energy	<i>"Really tired ... by the time we'd finished the session it was like wow that was fantastic. I felt energised. The guys are so appreciative ... responding to the music."</i>
Achievement	<i>"Own sense of achievement is watching others achieve."</i>
Enhanced resilience and adaptability	<i>"Increased resilience and adaptability."</i>
Increased quality of artistic playing	<i>"The musicians get quite stimulated by the creative way of working ... It's resulted in better artistic playing quality to the orchestra as a whole. If you've got more stimulated players, they're actually more engaged in what they're doing."</i>
Increased understanding of diverse groups /breaking the stereotypes	<i>"More informed view about groups that are marginalised in our society."</i> <i>"Value and worth in prisoners."</i> <i>"Breakdown stereotypes about prisoners."</i>

Table 12: Outcomes for CSO musicians

Outcomes for CSO

Respondents were asked for their views about the outcomes for the Christchurch Symphony Orchestra. The outcomes mentioned by the respondents included:

- Build on the relationship with Department of Corrections and Pathway Trust.
- Exceeded our expectations.
- Challenging stereotypes about the CSO.
- Increased awareness of the programme by funders, politicians, and other stakeholders.

“For our supporters, I think it excites them to think of the musicians doing a wider range of work.” (stakeholder)

Longer-term outcomes

Respondents were asked to consider possible longer-term outcomes for the Tū Ora of participating in the CSO Platform Programme. In this context longer-term outcomes were defined as those that occur within 6-12 months of completing the programme. Overall the respondents hoped the CSO Platform Programme would bring about change for the good and that it would make the transition to the community more seamless for the Tū Ora. Of the longer-term outcomes identified by the respondents four suggestions predominated.

Firstly, respondents believed that completing the CSO Platform Programme would result in an increased ability and confidence to deal with new and difficult situations in the future. According to the respondents because the Tū Ora succeeded in learning instruments and music, they will feel better and more confident in themselves to tackle new and difficult tasks in the future. This is important to the Tū Ora's transition into the community because most of the daily tasks that we take for granted are new to them, for example finding employment, finding accommodation, paying bills, etc.

“Confidence to deal with difficulties they may face in the future.” (stakeholder)

“Confidence to try something new in the future and follow it through, even if it doesn't

feel like it's working out to begin with.” (Tū Ora)

“Increased ability to deal with life's challenges ... the performance in front of so many people bearing their souls and being vulnerable in that moment and that going well could be a reminder to them that they've done difficult things before and managed them.” (stakeholder)

“It opens the mind to the possibility of trying something new.” (whānau)

“Draw on later ... try something I've never done before and succeeded so I know I can do it.” (Tū Ora)

Secondly, increased positive self-concept was identified by respondents who said a positive self-image is important for our overall physical, mental, social, emotional and spiritual wellbeing. How the Tū Ora think about themselves affects how they feel about themselves and interact with others.

“Positive memories define a person's positive self-concept.” (whānau)

“Creates a different self-concept. I've done some pretty shitty things, but I'm OK as a person now.” (stakeholder)

“... gives them a sense of meaning to their lives and positive self-image.” (whānau)

Thirdly, respondents hoped the Tū Ora would have fond memories of participating in the CSO Platform Programme which they believed was rare in a prison environment.

“Positive experience while in prison ... a formative experience ... something they got something out of.” (stakeholder)

“I hope they just consider music as something they associate with happiness or joy... having fun.” (stakeholder)

Fourthly, the respondents noted that in the longer-term that participation in the CSO Platform Programme would encourage the Tū Ora to take up something creative.

“Confidence to pick up an instrument and play it.” (stakeholder)

“Spark an interest and do something creative.” (whānau)

“Further develop their music skills.” (stakeholder)

“Use the creative aspects in the programme that they can call on when needed.” (stakeholder)

The other longer-term outcomes mentioned by the respondents included:

- Increased ability to manage their anger.

“I’m going to take what I’ve learned when I leave here ... had anger management issues ... what I learned from this programme was patience ... patience of having to learn something that I didn’t know ... that calmed me down.” (Tū Ora)

- Strengthen relationships with whānau and peers.

“The ukulele is something I’m going to take home to teach my kids.” (Tū Ora)

“Stronger friendships with the people they did the programme with.” (whānau)

- Increased awareness of feelings.

“Music gives participants the opportunity to gain insight into their inner feelings.” (stakeholder)

“Encouragement that they are doing well ... a boost of confidence to keep doing the good stuff they have been doing.” (whānau)

“The programme provides an opportunity for the Tū Ora to express a level of vulnerability and experience positive regard expressed back to them. So those life experiences show there’s safety in vulnerability.” (stakeholder)

From a community perspective, respondents believed that inviting members of the community to the performance given by the Tū Ora and the CSO

musicians broke down the stereotypes that people have about prisoners.

Satisfaction

Respondents were asked to assess their level of satisfaction with the CSO Platform Programme. On average respondents scored 4.5 on a Likert scale of between 1-5 where 1 is very dissatisfied and 5 is very satisfied, with the range being between 3 and 5. The main reasons given by respondents for their level of satisfaction included seeing the achievements of the Tū Ora acknowledged and personal growth of the Tū Ora. For example, through the programme unexpected talents and leadership emerged; and the men regained their sense of identity and began to heal.

“This is a unique opportunity for the Tū Ora to perform in a concert. They achieved after eight-weeks of hard work and they were recognised for that achievement.” (stakeholder)

“The beauty of this is it’s not empty encouragement because they’ve earned that, ... they’ve worked hard, they’ve learned a new skill, they’ve applied themselves, they were brave enough to be vulnerable in an environment where there’s the potential to fail. Pride, satisfaction and affirmation are pretty rare in this environment.” (stakeholder)

Additionally, the Tū Ora taking ownership of the projects and the performance brought a sense of fulfilment for some respondents. The Tū Ora took responsibility for taking the programme seriously, created many aspects of the final performance and took over the Master of Ceremony role.

“We’d given them something at the start and then they were ready to give it to the audience at the end. We’d given them the nuts and bolts and the framework, and they had turned it into a work of art at the end.” (stakeholder)

Other respondents noted their level of satisfaction was influenced by the sense of belonging and connectedness they witnessed amongst the CSO and Tū Ora participants – a connectedness that came from participating in the creation of music on an equal level.

“Participating on an equal level with talented musicians and feeling that sense of belonging and connectedness, that sense of accomplishment and pride – all the things that the prison environment does not give them.”
(stakeholder)

Other respondents referred to the synergy created by the team at the performance by creating something bigger than any single person and ... the buzz of meeting their families.

Still other respondents referred to the organisational gains made by the respective agencies involved. For example, one respondent mentioned that their level of satisfaction was influenced by the collaboration between Pathway Trust and CSO, in particular reference was made to a number of the elements of collective impact – elements that can greatly accelerate the pace of change and lasting social impact.²²

“We are extremely grateful to the CSO for filling the spaces we have created. There’s a common accord, there’s good engagement, ... shared commitment. They follow through with what they say they’re going to do.”
(stakeholder)

In the same view another respondent stated that it speaks to ‘music for everyone’ more broadly than other programmes – a reference to the way the Platform Programme has the potential to create wellbeing for the Tū Ora and their whānau, many of whom have been subject to multiple inequalities in their communities. The Platform Programme has the potential to build on this success and grow.

For those who scored their level of satisfaction more conservatively their reasons for doing so included: Needing answers to questions such as: What outcomes are the Tū Ora experiencing? Should there be another aspect to the Platform Programme that comes after the release of the Tū Ora from prison or should it be a one-off offering? Other respondents believed more was required to strengthen the organisation and presentation of the projects that comprised the Platform Programme. For example, explaining why a piece of music was chosen for the Tū Ora and what it means for the CSO to provide them with some context around the projects

they are participating in. Also, more was required to specify what each project was trying to accomplish.

Success factors

Success factors are the mediating elements of the programme that are assumed to either empirically or experientially contribute to the outcomes sought for the participants. Respondents were asked to comment on the factors they thought contributed to the outcomes sought for the Tū Ora.

Overwhelmingly the two success factors the respondents most frequently referred to were the attributes and skills of the musicians and their approach to teaching.

Attributes and skills of the musicians

The respondents noted the different strengths and skills brought by each of the musicians and that they connect really well together. The diverse skills mentioned by the respondents included teaching and engaging the men; being very clear and articulate in explaining things and very gentle and patient; working alongside people, encouraging, friendly and approachable; great improviser making everything that was played sound fantastic

Attributes and skills of the musicians that the respondents stated contributed to the outcomes achieved by the Tū Ora included:

- Being people from the community.

“People from outside the prison.” (whānau)

- Being genuine about their interactions with, and valuing of the Tū Ora, and holding the CSO’s vision and mission for community engagement with integrity.

“Integrity of the musicians ... in there with conviction that the work they are doing has value and they’ve got something to give.”
(stakeholder)

²²Collective Impact initiatives are characterised by five elements: common agenda; mutually reinforcing activities; continuous communication; shared measurement system and backbone support (Kania & Kramer, 2015; Raderstrong & Boyea-Robinson, 2016).

“Musicians have to be genuine in their motivations to do the programme. Otherwise you wouldn’t get the ideas and the high level of involvement of the Tū Ora.” (stakeholder)

positive self-regard and non-judgemental communication style.” (stakeholder)

“Open and honest.” (whānau)

“Communicate with a sense of genuineness ... highly skilled individuals who communicate to the men that they are valued ... use

“Belief in community engagement and CSO.” (stakeholder)

Being non-judgemental

“Personalities of the CSO musicians ... a quiet way of working with the men; self-confidence as you don’t want to be projecting any insecurities on the men ... non-judgemental.” (stakeholder)

“You guys don’t judge us ... you’d be surprised at how often we get judged.” (Tū Ora)

Highly skilled musicians

“Team ... skilled at what they do.” (whānau)

“Expertly supported by the CSO musicians.” (stakeholder)

Working in a collaborative manner

“The people from the orchestra ... the way they interact, the way they run with the Tū Ora’s strengths ... huge part of the success of the programme.” (stakeholder)

“The way the team delivered the programme, it invites the men to bring whatever talent they have to the fore.” (stakeholder)

“The musicians create the space and freedom for the creativity to come out.” (whānau)

Approach

The approach taken by the CSO musicians to deliver the Platform Programme was the second most frequently mentioned success factor. This comprised of an action-based, scaffolding teaching and learning model together with self-directed learning when appropriate. The programme was delivered in a collaborative (in terms of designing, delivering and leading), strengths-based manner and the communication and learning styles were tailored to meet the Tū Ora's preferences.

“Self-directed learning ... allowed me to sit in that space and go at my own pace and do it the way I wanted to do it and they didn't push me, they didn't rush me, and they didn't judge me.” (Tū Ora)

“Demonstrating and then taking the learning at a pace so everyone remains engaged.” (stakeholder)

“Equal collaborative contribution to the programme.” (whānau)

“They're almost invisible ... a real mark of success is they are not front and centre in this environment.” (stakeholder)

“The ones that work best are those where the participants have a big part in designing the content.” (stakeholder)

“They're collaborating with us and with each other ... asking each other about how to play the chords.” (Tū Ora)

“Their ability to explain things really clearly.” (Tū Ora)

“Social awareness ... being able to pick up on social cues ... noticing if someone's switching off or is really nailing it. Then engaging them in a way that is really constructive and suitable.” (stakeholder)

The other elements noted by respondents in relation to the approach included the voluntary nature of the Tū Ora's participation in the programme and the balance between providing projects that were challenging in a safe and nurturing environment for the men to learn.

“Voluntary nature of the CSO's involvement ... changes the relationship when they're there because they see the value in you. They don't have to do this, but they've chosen to.” (whānau)

“Outside scope of experience ... enter the stretch zone that provides opportunities for growth and change.” (stakeholder)

“Nurturing an environment where the men can learn.” (stakeholder)

“Safe and empowering environment for the men to learn.” (stakeholder)

Flexibility was noted by the respondents and included being adaptable in terms of the content of each project (for example, discarding projects that did not seem to work and including projects suggested by the Tū Ora) and length of each session (depending on the energy levels of the Tū Ora).

“Flexibility of session lengths depending on the energy, focus and interest of the participants.” (stakeholder)

“The balance between flexibility and structure, so we’ve got some things in place but an ability to throw away ideas that don’t work and to accommodate new ideas.” (stakeholder)

“Adaptable ... tailor the music to the men.” (whānau)

“Allowing the participants to have their own ideas and spin on stuff that we work on ... I think in the beginning we do a lot of showing and demonstrating but most important is doing it with them.” (stakeholder)

“Role is to help you with the music, not direct you.” (stakeholder)

The respondents recognised that music has the potential to support people’s wellbeing – wellbeing in relation to the four dimensions of Te Whare Tapa Whā: taha tinana (physical health), taha hinengaro (mental and emotional wellbeing for example, self-confidence), taha whānau (social wellbeing, for example self-esteem) and taha wairua (spiritual wellbeing). This experiential finding is supported by the empirical literature (Grape et al, 2003).

“At the prison we see a visible response to the music ... music needs to be delivered with authenticity and sincerity ... our DNA know when you’re playing a good song.” (stakeholder)

The partnership that has developed between the CSO and the Pathway Trust and the Department of Corrections is regarded as a critical success factor. This partnership provided access to the prison, an understanding of the correctional environment, access to the Tū Ora and support to deliver the Platform Programme.

“Pathway Trust have been fantastic to deal with and seem to really appreciate the work we are doing.” (stakeholder)

“Partnership with Pathway Trust and Department of Corrections is critical to the programme.” (stakeholder)

Lastly, all the respondents regarded the Tū Ora as part of the success of the Platform Programme. Their willingness to take themselves out of their comfort zone and the trust and respect between everybody is key to making people feel safe in this process.

Opportunities for improvement

The respondents were asked what aspects of the Platform Programme need to be strengthened, removed or added to improve the programme. Of the suggestions to strengthen the programme, the respondents offered the following suggestions:

- Keep searching for new projects that will interest the Tū Ora.

“Continue to find projects that balance the interests of the men with the skills of the musicians ... the group that is facilitating the programme at present is very creative.” (stakeholder)

“Keep the programme evolving and fresh ... this worked a year ago, should we still be doing it today or are we sounding stale? (stakeholder)

- Include a clear start and finish to the programme with the length of each session determined by the focus and interest of the Tū Ora.

“Clear start ... now it’s time to focus. Strong exit to provide a feeling of accomplishment.” (stakeholder)

- Have bigger ukuleles.

“The ones we’ve got are small and the men struggle with the chords as their hands are big.” (stakeholder)

One respondent suggested removing the projects that do not have strong learning outcomes.

“The weakest ones are the monkey see monkey do kind of thing. We just show them what to do and they do it. They might look good in a performance, but they are very contrived and there’s less mental engagement.” (stakeholder)

Several of the respondents suggested additions to the Platform Programme that have the potential to improve it. Their suggested additions included:

- Provide the musicians with more background about the programmes the CSO musicians are asked to facilitate.

“Sometimes it feels like we turn up somewhere and then we get to know what we are doing.” (stakeholder)

- Add more structure to the programme. For example, writing clear goals about what needs to be accomplished during each session. More structure is needed if the programme is to evolve, such as more programmes being facilitated simultaneously, structure would support new musicians from having to reinvent the wheel.
- Respondents stated that many of the Tū Ora had never seen a whole orchestra playing and

suggested giving them an experience of that nature.

“Maybe closer to the end of the programme show the Tū Ora a video of an orchestra, explain what an orchestra does, tell them about how the orchestra performs, how they dress and describe the people who come to see the orchestra ... perhaps open their minds a bit.” (stakeholder)

- Play as an orchestra so the Tū Ora experience what it’s like playing in an orchestra.

“One of the best things about playing in an orchestra is the feeling of being part of this massive thing. Perhaps some more people from the orchestra could join us for the concert and include the men we have been working with on the programme.” (stakeholder)

- Debrief session after the performance.

“There is value in having a debriefing session without the instruments ... coming in and saying how was that for you. This galvanises the learning.” (stakeholder)

Comments from the Tū Ora and their whānau

Overall the Tū Ora believed that within the resource constraints, for example limited time and number of musicians, there was nothing the CSO musicians could do to improve the Platform Programme. The Tū Ora noted the CSO musicians kept the programme simple and were helpful and skilful.

“They can’t really improve on what they do. They’re good.” (Tū Ora)

While the Tū Ora thought the instruments were great, they suggested that different instruments and songs for next time might be useful.

Similarly, the whānau had no recommendations for change. The aspects of the Platform Programme they liked best were that the songs and the music were created through the combined effort of the Tū Ora and the CSO musicians; and the musicians were very caring.

Programme theory re-visited

The programme theory developed for the CSO Platform Programme explains how the necessary preconditions (i.e. the resources and aspects of the intervention) are understood to contribute to a chain of results that produce the intended impacts. This programme theory has been developed using the respondents' views about the factors that contribute to the short and intermediate outcomes.²³

The intention of comparing the programme theory developed from the empirical literature with the programme theory developed from the respondents' data is to compare the multiple perspectives of the respondents on the actual resources, activities and outcomes of the Platform Programme with the intended inputs, activities and outcomes as presented in the empirical literature. If the two align somewhat then this could be regarded as some evidence of success (Brest, 2010; Clark & Taplin, 2012; Taplin et al., 2013).

When the two theories of change are compared, there were similar sorts of inputs and activities. The only exceptions included:

- The 'Tū Ora and the voluntary nature of their participation and their willingness to go outside their comfort zone'.
- The 'programme and project goals'.

- The 'theory-informed projects'.
- 'Offer a continuum of programmes inside and outside the prison'.

When comparing the outcomes in the two programme theories they mostly aligned with a couple of exceptions including:

- The additional short-term outcomes in Figure 2 included 'achievement motivation' and some of the social competencies.
- The additional intermediate outcomes including 'seamless transition to the community' and 'challenging stereotypes'.

Aim of the Platform Programme

The aim of this programme is to develop their personal skills; their ability to overcome fear of failure, to communicate constructively and support their colleagues, to learn more about each other through their shared experience, to control their frustrations and to concentrate for longer, to grow their self-confidence and to enable them to experience a buzz from achieving a quality performance (Christchurch Symphony Orchestra, 2019).



²³Respondents were not asked to predict the long-term outcomes because of the short length of this evaluation project. They were asked what outcomes occurred immediately following the programme (short-term outcomes) and what outcomes they predicted for the Tū Ora six to twelve months after the programme (intermediate outcomes).

Programme theory revisited: Respondents' views



Figure 2: Programme theory revisited: Respondents' views

Other factors contributing to the outcomes

Navigate Initiative, Pathway Trust: Respondents stated that Pathway Trust operates in a way to reconnect people with their relationships, with opportunities in life, with their skills, with who they are and with their strengths. It empowers people in their dreams and their potential, in their abilities and their own ideas for life. It restores relationships, restores people's dignity, restores their sense of wellbeing and wellness. People living well is how we make safe communities

Future opportunities

Most respondents were in favour of an expansion of the Platform Programme both before and following release from prison. In relation to expanding the programme to include more and different projects while people are in prison (for example, a Platform Programme at Christchurch Women's Prison; Youth Justice Units; Units at Rolleston Prison), a few respondents noted that follow-up is needed post-release to assess whether the positive behavioural changes made inside the wire continue after release, otherwise it's of little value.

Other suggestions for the future development of the CSO Platform Programme included:

- Mixing contemporary and traditional music, especially for young people.
- Meeting the men in the early evening as most of the men have employment-related commitments during the day.
- Introducing a band in the prison.
- Developing programmes that are tailored to people's different levels of expertise.

Of the notion of extending the programme to include post-release sessions, some respondents stated this was needed to continue to impact their lives out here. Several respondents suggested initiating a post-release music group that included people with experience of a custodial sentence and those who did not have this experience. Others suggested a mentoring programme

for parents who had experience of prison and who after release were teaching their children to play an instrument. Others suggested working with the Tū Ora after their release to hold a public concert.

***"If you were to expand the programme and run it more consistently and longer ... for those who have some talent, it could have real value if it flowed into the community."* (stakeholder)**

“ Give people a similar experience outside of prison. I think they would participate because they absolutely loved the programme.”

(stakeholder)

***"To work with the guys on release to gain some continuity and present in public concerts. This would allow us to use some instruments and equipment that we can't get into the prison."* (stakeholder)**

***"It's the missing bit when they are released ... developing their music skills outside the prison."* (stakeholder)**

The respondents warned that any community-based programme is subject to a lot of challenges for the Tū Ora during the transition after they are released, and human resource is required to address such barriers.

***"Release period is inherently challenging for people ... emotional energy to undertake a programme is limited ... don't have transport, don't know where it is, don't have diaries So, what's needed ... is someone to hold their hand ... to start to overcome some of these things while the men make the transition."* (stakeholder)**

References

- Achenbach, T.A., Ivanova, M.Y., Rescoria, L.A., Turner, L.V., & Althoff, R.R. (2016). Internalising/Externalising Problems: Review and Recommendations for Clinical and Research Application. *Journal of the American Academy of Child & Adolescent Psychiatry*, 55, August: 647-656.
- Alkin, M. C., & Taut, S. M. (2003). Unbundling Evaluation Use. *Studies in Educational Evaluation*, 29, 1-12.
- Anderson, K. and Overy, K. (2010). Engaging Scottish young offenders in education through music and art. *International Journal of Community Music*, 3 (1), 47-64. DOI:10.1386/ijcm.3.1.47/1 Available from: https://www.researchgate.net/publication/263677467_Learning_rehabilitation_and_the_arts_in_prisons_a_Scottish_case_study.
- Aotearoa New Zealand Evaluation Association (2015). *Evaluation Standards for Aotearoa New Zealand*. Wellington: Superu.
- Arts Education Partnership (2004). The Arts and Education: New Opportunities for Research. Retrieved from: <http://www.aep-arts.org/wp-content/uploads/2012/08/OppotunitiesResearch.pdf>.
- Balfour, M., Bartleet, B. L., Davey, L., Rynne, J., & Schippers, H. (Eds). (2019). *Performing Arts in Prisons: Creative Perspectives*. Bristol, UK: Intellect.
- Bandura, A. (1997). *The exercise of control*. New York, NY: Freeman.
- Baumeister, R. F., Campbell, J. D., Krueger, J. I., & Vohs, K. D. (2003). Does high self-esteem cause better performance, interpersonal success, happiness, or healthier lifestyles? *Psychological Science in the Public Interest*, 4(1), 1-44.
- Bentahar, O., & Cameron, R. (2015). Design and Implementation of a Mixed Method Research Study in Project Management. *The Electronic Journal of Business Research Methods*, 13: 1, 3-15. Retrieved from: www.ejbrm.com
- Bilby, C., Caulfield, L., & Ridley, L. (2013). *Re-imagining futures: Exploring arts interventions and the process of desistance*. London: Arts Alliance.
- Bittman, B., Dickson, L., & Coddington, K. (2009). Creative musical expression as a catalyst for quality-of-life improvement in inner-city adolescents placed in a court-referred residential treatment program. *Advances in Mind-Body Medicine*, 24 (1), 8-19.
- Blacker, J., Watson, A. and Beech, A.R. (2008). A Combined Drama-Based and CBT Approach to Working with Self-Reported Anger Aggression. *Criminal Behaviour and Mental Health*, 18, 129-37.
- Boswell, G., Wedge, P., & Price, A. (2004). *The Impact of Fathers Inside: An OLSU and Safe Ground Parenting Course for Male Prisoners at HMP Ashwell*. Norwich: University of East Anglia.
- Bottoms, A., Shapland, J., Costello, A., Holmes, D. & Mair, G. (2004). Towards desistance: theoretical underpinnings for an empirical study. *The Howard Journal of Criminal Justice*, 43(4): 368-89. Retrieved from: https://www.researchgate.net/publication/263677467_Learning_rehabilitation_and_the_arts_in_prisons_a_Scottish_case_study.

- Brandon, P. R., Newton, B. J., & Herman, J.W. (1993). Enhancing validity through beneficiaries' equitable involvement in identifying and prioritising homeless children's educational problems. *Evaluation and Program Planning*, 16(4): 287-293.
- Brest, P. (2010). *The Power of Theories of Change*. Stanford Social Innovation review. Spring.
- Brewster, L. (1983). *An Evaluation of the Arts-in-Corrections Program of the California Department of Corrections*. Retrieved from: http://williamjamesassociation.org/prison_arts/
- Brewster, L. (2012). *Qualitative Study of the Arts-in-Corrections Program*. Retrieved from: file:///C:/Users/Owner/Documents/Research%20and%20Evaluation/CSO%20Evaluation/previous%20research/brewster%202012%20qualitative%20study%20of%20the%20california%20arts-in-corrections%20program.pdf
- Brewster, L. (2014). The Impact of Prison Arts Programs on Inmates Attitudes and Behaviour: A Quantitative Evaluation. *Justice Policy Journal*, 11(2): 1-28.
- Brewster, L. & Merts, P. (2012). *Paths of Discovery: Art Practice and Its Impact in California Prisons*. Retrieved from: www.createspace.com/3916681.
- Carroll, L. J., & Rothe, J.P. (2010). Levels of Reconstruction as Complementarity in Mixed Methods Research: A Social Theory-Based Conceptual Framework for Integrating Qualitative and Quantitative Research. *International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health*, 7: 3478-3488. doi:10.3390/ijerph7093478.
- Caulfield, L. S., & Wilson, D. (2010). Female offenders' experiences of the arts in criminal justice. *Journal of Social Criminology*, 3: 67-90.
- Cepeda, G., & Martin, D. (2005). A review of case studies publishing in Management Decision 2003-2004: Guides and criteria for achieving quality in qualitative research. *Management Decision*, 43 (6): 851- 876. <http://doi.org/10.1108/00251740510603600>
- Chen, X. (2014). *Music therapy for improving mental health problems of offenders in correctional settings*. Ph.D. Dissertation, Aalborg University, Denmark.
- Chen, X. J., Aara, L., Manger, T., & Gold, C. (2016a). *Music Therapy for Improving Mental Health in Offenders: Protocol for a Systematic Review and Meta-analysis*. Bergen, Norway: The Grieg Academy of Music Therapy Research Centre.
- Chen, X. J., Hannibal, N., Xu, K., & Gold, C. (2012). Group Music Therapy for Prisoners: Protocol for a Randomised Controlled Trial. *Nordic Journal of Music Therapy*, 23(3), 224-241. 10.1080/08098131.2013.854268.
- Chen, X. J., Leith, H., Aara, L., Manger, T., & Gold, C. (2016). Music Therapy for Improving Mental Health in Offenders in Correctional Settings: Systematic Review and Meta-analysis. *J Exp Criminal* 12: 209-228. Doi 10.1007/s11292-015-9250-y.
- Chen, X. J., Leith, H. & Gold, C. (2012). *Music Therapy for Offenders*. (protocol for a Cochrane review). Manuscript submitted for publication.
- Christchurch Symphony Orchestra (2019). *Music for Everyone: The Christchurch Symphony Orchestra Community Engagement Programme*. Christchurch: Christchurch Symphony Orchestra.

- Christchurch Symphony Orchestra (2019). Christchurch Symphony Orchestra 2019 Season. Christchurch: Christchurch Symphony Orchestra.
- Clarke, H., & Taplin, D. (2012). *Theory of Change Basics: A Primer on Theory of Change*. New York: Acknowledge.
- Cleveland, W. (1992). *Art in Other Places: Artists at work in America's community and social institutions*. Praeger.
- Codding, P. (2002). A comprehensive survey of music therapists participating in correctional 22 psychiatry: demographics, conditions of employment, service provision, assessment, therapeutic objectives, and related values of the therapist. *Music Therapy Perspectives*, 20(1), 56–68.
- Cohen, M. L. (2009). Choral Singing and Prison Inmates: Influences of Performing in a Prison Choir. *The Journal of Correctional Education*, 60(1), 52-65.
- Cohen, M. L. (2012). Harmony within the Walls. Perceptions of Worthiness and Competence in a Community Prison Choir. *International Journal of Music Art Education* 30(1): 46-56.
- Cohen, L. Manion, L. & Morrison, K. (2007). *Research Methods in Education*, 6th Edition. London: Routledge.
- Cohen, S., & Taylor, L. (1972). *Psychological survival: the experience of long-term imprisonment*. Harmondsworth: Penguin Books Limited.
- Compton-Dickinson, S. (2015). *A Feasibility Trial of Group Cognitive Analytic Music Therapy (G-CAMT) in Secure Hospital Settings*. Ph.D. Thesis. Anglia Ruskin University, UK.
- Conner, T. S., DeYoung, C.G., & Silvia, P.J. (2018). Everyday creative activity as a path to flourishing. *The Journal of Positive Psychology*, 13:2, 181-189, DOI: 10.1080/17439760.2016.1257049
- Crawley, E. M. (2004). Emotion and Performance: Prison Officers and the Presentation of Self in Prisons. *Punishment and Society*, 6(4).
- Crossick, G., & Kaszynska, P. (2016). *Understanding the Value of Arts and Culture*. The AHRC Cultural Value Project.
- Daveson, B. A., & Edwards, J. (2001). A descriptive study exploring the role of music therapy in prisons. *The Arts in Psychotherapy* 28, 137-141.
- Daykin, N., Moriarty, Y., de Viggiani, N., & Pilkington, P. (2011). *Evidence Review: Music Making with Young Offenders and Young People at Risk of Offending*. Bristol: University of West England.
- Daykin, N., Orme, J., Evans, D. & Salmon, D. (2008). The impact of participating in performing arts on adolescent health and behaviour: A systematic review of the literature. *Journal of Health Psychology*, 13(2): 251-64.
- Daykin, N., de Viggiani, N., Moriarty, Y. & Pilkington, P. (2017). Music making for health and wellbeing in youth justice settings: Mediated affordances and the impact of context and social relations. *Sociology of Health and Illness*, 39(6): 941-958.
- deMunck, Victor C. & Sobo, Elisa J. (Eds) (1998). *Using methods in the field: a practical introduction and casebook*. Walnut Creek, CA: AltaMira Press.
- De Nora, T. (2000). *Music in everyday life*. Cambridge, MA: Cambridge University Press.

- DeWalt, Kathleen M. & DeWalt, Billie R. (2002). *Participant observation: a guide for fieldworkers*. Walnut Creek, CA: AltaMira Press.
- De Viggiani, N., Macintosh, S., & Lang, P. (2010). *Music in Time: An Evaluation of a Participatory Creative Music Programme for Older Prisoners*. Bristol: University of the West of England.
- Duguid S., & Pawson R. (1998). Education, Change and Transformation: The Prison Experience. *Evaluation Review* 22(4):470-495.
- Daykin, N., de Viggiani, N., Moriarty, Y., & Pilkington, P. (2017). Music-making for health and wellbeing in youth justice settings: mediated affordance and the impact of context and social relations. *Sociology of Health and Illness*, 39(6): 941-958. Doi: 10.1111/1467-9566.12549.
- Erkkilä, J., Punkanen, M., Fachner, J., Ala-Ruona, E., Pöntiö, I., Tervaniemi, M., et al. (2011). Individual music therapy for depression: randomised controlled trial. *British Journal of Psychiatry*, 199(2), 132–139.
- Farrall, S. & Caverley, A. (2006) *Understanding Desistance from Crime, Crime and Justice Series*. London: Open University Press.
- Feder, E., & Feder, B. (1981). *The Expressive Art Therapies*. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice-Hall Inc.
- Flyvbjerg, B. (2011). Case study. In N.K. Denzin & Y.S. Lincoln (Eds.). *The sage handbook of qualitative research (4th edition)*. pp. 301-316). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Fredrickson, B. L., & Branigan, C. (2001). Positive emotions. In T. J. Mayne & G. A. Bonanno (Eds.), *Emotions: Current issues and future directions* (pp. 123-151), New York: Guilford Press.
- Gold, C., Assmus, J., Hjernevik, K., Qvale, L. G., Brown, F. K., Hansen, A. L., Waage, L., & Stige, B. (2013). Music Therapy for Prisoners: Pilot Randomised Controlled Trial and Implications for Evolutionary Psychosocial Interventions. *Journal of Offender Therapy and Comparative Criminology*, 58(2).
- Goodrich, K. (2004). *The Means of Production: A qualitative evaluation of a long-term drama residency facilitated by Rideout (Creative Arts for Rehabilitation) in HMP Dovegate Therapeutic Community 2003-2004*. Stoke-on-Trent: Rideout (Creative Arts for Rehabilitation). Retrieved from: https://www.researchgate.net/publication/263677467_Learning_rehabilitation_and_the_arts_in_prisons_a_Scottish_case_study.
- Grape, C., Sandgren, M., Hansson, L. O., Ericson, M., & Theorell, T. (2003). Does singing promote wellbeing? An empirical study of professional and amateur singers during a singing lesson. *Journal of Integrative Physiological Behavioural Science*, 38(1): 65-74.
- Greene, J. G. (1988). Stakeholder participation and utilization in program evaluation. *Evaluation Review*, 12, 91-116.
- Gude, O. (2009). *Art Education for a Democratic Life*. Lowenfeld Lecture presented at the National Art Education Association National Convention, Minneapolis, MN. www.arteducators.org/research/2009_LowenfeldLecture_OliviaGude.pdf
- Guijt, I. (2014). *Participatory Approaches, Methodological Briefs: Impact Evaluation 5*. Florence: UNICEF Office of Research.
- Henry, G. T., & Mark, M. M. (2003). Beyond use: Understanding evaluation's influence on attitudes and actions. *American Journal of Evaluation*, 24(3): 293-314.

- Hernandez, M. (2000). Using Logic-Models and Program Theory to Build Outcome Accountability. *Education and Treatment of Children, 23*(1): 24-40.
- Hughes, J. (2005). *Doing the Arts Justice: A Review of Research Literature, Practice and Theory*. UK: Anne Peaker Centre. Retrieved from: http://www.artscouncil.org.uk/publication_archive/doing-thearts-justice-a-review-of-research-literature-practice-and-theory/
- Jermyn, H. (2001). *Arts and social exclusion: a review prepared for the Arts Council of England*. Arts Council England.
- Jewkes, Y. (2005). Loss, liminality and the life sentence: Managing identity through a disrupted life course. In Liebling, A., & Maruna, S. (eds.). *The Effects of Imprisonment*. Devon: Wilan Publishing pp. 366-388.
- Jewkes, Y. (2005). Men Behind Bars: "Doing" Masculinity as an Adaptation to Imprisonment. *Men and Masculinity, 8*(1).
- Jewkes, Y., & Johnston, H. (2006). *Prison Readings: A Critical Introduction to Prisons and Imprisonment*. Cullompton: Wilan Publishing.
- Johnson, I. M (2008). A palace for art in prisons: Art as a tool for rehabilitation and management. *South West Journal of Criminal Justice, 5*(2): 100-120.
- Johnson, L. (2007). Jail Wall Drawings and Jail Art Programs: Invaluable Tools for Corrections. *International Journal of Criminal Justice, 5, (2)*: 100-120.
- Kamalanathan, A. (2016). The Role of Music in Inmate Rehabilitation. *Journal of Gender, Social Policy and the Law, March*.
- Kania, J., & Kramer, M. (2015). The equity imperative in collective impact. *Stanford Social Innovation Review, 36-41*.
- Kennedy, V. & Cram, F. (2010). Ethics of Researching with Whānau Collectives. *MAI Review, 3*. Retrieved from: <http://review.mai.ac.nz>
- Krakauer, J. W., & Shadmehr, R. (2006). Consolidation of motor memory. *Trends in Neurosciences, 29 (1)*: 58-64. doi:10.1016/j.tins.2005.10.003. PMC 2553888.
- Krueger, Robert F., Markon, K. E., Patrick, C. J., & Iacono, W. G. (2005). Externalising Psychopathology in Adulthood: A Dimensional- spectrum Conceptualisation and Its Implications for DSM-V. *Journal of Abnormal Psychology, 114*(4): 537-550. doi:10.1037/0021-843X.114.4.537
- Langelid, T., Maki, M., Raundrup, K., Svensson, S. (Eds.) (2009). *Nordic Prison Education, A Lifelong Learning Perspective*. Translated by Linda Schenck. Retrieved from: www.diva-portal.org/smash/get/diva2:700745/FULLTEXT01.pdf
- Leith, H. (2014). *Music therapy and the resettlement of women prisoners*. Ph.D. Dissertation, Aalborg University, Denmark.
- Liebling, A., & Maruna, S. (Eds.) (2005). *The Effects of Imprisonment*. Cullompton: Wilan Publishing.
- Lincoln, Yvonna S. & Guba, Egon G. (1994). *Naturalistic inquiry*. Beverly Hills, CA: Sage.
- MacArthur, D. & Law, S.A. (1996). *The Arts and Prosocial Impact Study: A Review of Current Programs and Literature*. Rand Corporation.
- Maclachlan, K., Hall, S., Tett, L., Crowther, J. & Edwards, V. (2008). *Motivating Adult Learners to Persist, Progress and Achieve: Literacies learners at risk of non-completion of learning targets*. Edinburgh: Scottish Government.

- Martha, O. (2015). *The Role of Music in the Rehabilitation of Nigerian Prisoners: A Case Study of Enugu Prison in Nigeria*. Retrieved from: <https://icsai.org/procarch/2iclehi/2iclehi-73.pdf>
- Maruna, S. (2001). *Making good: How ex-convicts reform and rebuild their lives*. Washington, DC, US: American Psychological Association.
- Maruna, S. (2010). *The Great Escape: Exploring the Rehabilitative Dynamics Involved in 'Changing Tunes'*. Belfast: Institute of Criminology and Criminal Justice, Queen's University.
- Maruna, S. (2011). Re-entry as a rite of passage. *Punishment and Society*, 13(1): 3-28.
- Matarasso, F. and Chell, J. (1998). *Vital Signs: Mapping Community Art in Belfast*. Stroud: Comedia.
- Mathiti, V. (2002). *An evaluation into a diversion into music education (DIME) programme for at-risk youth: Implications for programme development*. Paper presented at the 14th International Congress on Child Abuse and Neglect, Denver, Colorado.
- McCue, I. (2010). Barlinnie Theatre Nemo Project. Glasgow: Theatre Nemo. *Learning, rehabilitation and the arts in prisons: a Scottish case study*. Retrieved from: https://www.researchgate.net/publication/263677467_Learning_rehabilitation_and_the_arts_in_prisons_a_Scottish_case_study.
- McNeill, F. (2006). A desistance paradigm for offender management. *Criminology and Criminal Justice* 6(1): 39-62.
- Mental Health Foundation (2019). Fact Sheet: Mana-enhancing communication – a framework. Wellington: Mental Health Foundation. Retrieved from: <https://www.mentalhealth.org.nz/assets/Working-Well/FS-mana-enhancing.pdf>
- Merriam, S. B. (1998). *Qualitative research and case study applications in education*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass Publishers.
- Merriam, S. B. (2009). *Qualitative research: A guide to design and implementation* (2nd ed.). San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.
- Miles, A. (2004). What works in offender rehabilitation: revealing the contribution of the arts in Cowling (ed.). *For Art's Sake? Society and the Arts in the 21st Century*. Institute for Public Policy Research.
- Miles, A., & Clarke, R. (2006). *The Arts in Criminal Justice: A Study of Research Feasibility*. Manchester: Centre for Research on Sociocultural Change, University of Manchester.
- Millar, A., Simeone, R. S. & Carnevale, J. T. (2001). Logic Models: A Systems Tool for Performance Management. *Evaluation and Program Planning*, 24(1):73-81.
- Moller, L. (2003). A Day in the Life of a Prison Theatre Program. *The Drama Review*, 47 (1), 49-73.
- Odell-Miller, H. (1995). Why provide Music Therapy in the community for adults with mental health problems? *British Journal of Music Therapy*, 9: 4-11.
- Odell-Miller, H. (2016). The Future of Music Therapy in Forensic and Criminal Justice Settings. In Cheryl Dileo (Ed.) *Envisioning the Future of Music Therapy*. Temple University Art and Quality of Life Research Centre.
- O'Grady, L. (2011). The therapeutic potentials of creating and performing music with women in prison: A qualitative case study. *Qualitative Inquiries in Music Therapy*, 6: 122-152.

- Palidofsky, M. (2010). If I Cry for You...Turning unspoken trauma into song and musical theatre. *International Journal of Community Music*, 3 (1): 121-128. Retrieved from: https://www.researchgate.net/publication/263677467_Learning_rehabilitation_and_the_arts_in_prisons_a_Scottish_case_study.
- Parkes, R., & Bilby, C. (2010). The Courage to Create: The Role of Artistic and Spiritual Activities in Prisons. *The Howard Journal of Criminal Justice*, 49(2).
- Patton, M. Q. (2008). *Utilization-focused evaluation* (4th ed). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Patton, M. Q. (2012). *Essentials of utilization-focused evaluation*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Procter, S. (2011). Reparative musicing: Thinking on the usefulness of social capital theory within music therapy. *Nordic Journal of Music Therapy*, 20: 242-262. Doi: 10.1080/08098131.2010.489998.
- Raderstrong, J., & Boyea-Robinson, T. (2016). The why and how of working with communities through collective impact. *Community Development*, 47(2): 181-193.
- Ramirez, R., & Brodhead, D. (2013). *Utilisation-focused evaluation: A primer for evaluators*. Penang, Malaysia: Southbound.
- Rovertson, P. (2003). Presenting the case for music. Coda Music Centre Retrieved from: www.mri.ac.uk/Research/Articles/Rovertson/
- Sänger, J., Müller, V., & Lindenberger, U. (2012). Intra- and interbrain synchronization and network properties when playing guitar in duets. *Frontiers in Human Neuroscience*, 6. DOI: 10.3389/fnhum.2012.00312
- Sapsford, R. (1983). *Life-Sentence Prisoners and Reaction, Response and Change*. Milton Keynes: Open University Press.
- Sautter, R. C. (1994). An Arts Education School Reform Strategy. *PHI Delta Kappan*, 75(6): 432-437.
- Schensul, Stephen L., Schensul, Jean J., & LeCompte, Margaret D. (1999). *Essential ethnographic methods: observations, interviews, and questionnaires* (Book 2 in Ethnographer's Toolkit). Walnut Creek, CA: AltaMira Press.
- Schrift, M. (2006). Angola Prison Art: Captivity, Creativity, and Consumerism. *Journal of American Folklore*, Summer 119, (473): 257-275.
- Shulha, L. M., & Cousins, J. B. (1997). Evaluation use: Theory, Research, and Practice since 1986. *Evaluation Practice*, 18: 195-208.
- Silber, L. (2005). Bars behind bars: the impact of a women's prison choir on social harmony. *Music Education Research*, 7 (2): 251-271.
- Simons, H. (2009). *Case study research in practice*. Los Angeles, CA: Sage.
- Smeijsters, H., Kil, J., Kurstjens, H., Welten, J., & Willemars, G. (2011). Art therapies for young offenders in secure care: A practice-based research. *Arts in Psychotherapy*, 38 (1):41-51.
- Stake, R. E. (2006). *Multiple case study analysis*. New York, NY: Guilford.
- Staub, E. (1987). Commentary on Part I. in N. Eisenberg & J. Strayer (Eds.), *Empathy and its development* (pp. 103-118). New York: Cambridge University Press.

- Stanley, B., Brown, G. K., Brent, D., Wells, K., Poling, K., Curry, J., et al. (2009). Cognitive Behaviour Therapy for Suicide Prevention (CBT-SP): Treatment model, feasibility and acceptability.
- Stevens, V. (2000). *The Importance of Creativity, Emotional Intelligence and the Arts for Education in the 21st Century*. Presented at the National Academy of recording Arts and Sciences. Retrieved from: www.drivictoriastevens.com/PDFs/V.Stevens_ArtEd_Handouts_SF_7-10.pdf.
- Stewart, A. (2014). Case study. In Jane Mills & M. Birks (Eds.). *Qualitative methodology: A practical guide* (pp. 145-159). Thousand oaks, CA: Sage.
- Stone, A., Bikson, T., Moini, J., & MacArthur, D. (1998). *The Arts and Prosocial Impact Study: Program Characteristics and Prosocial Effects*. Rand Corporation.
- Taplin, D., Clark, H., Collins, E., & Colby, D. (2013). *Technical Papers: A Series of Papers to support Development of Theories of Change Based on Practice in the Field*. New York: Acknowledge and the Rockefeller Foundation.
- Tett, L., Anderson, K., McNeill, F., Overy, K. & Sparks, R. (2012). Learning, rehabilitation and the arts in prisons: a Scottish case study. *Studies in the Education of Adults*, 44 (2): 171-185. ISSN 0266-0830 Retrieved from: https://www.researchgate.net/publication/263677467_Learning_rehabilitation_and_the_arts_in_prisons_a_Scottish_case_study.
- Thaut, M. H. (1989). The influence of music therapy interventions on self-rated changes in relaxation, affect, and thought in psychiatric prisoner-patients. *Journal of Music Therapy*, 26: 155-166.
- Tipene-Matua, B., Phillips, H., Cram, F., Parsons, M., & Taupo, K. (2009). *Old ways of having new conversations: Basing qualitative research within Tikanga Māori*. Auckland: Katoa Ltd. Retrieved from: www.katoa.net.nz/kaupapa-Māori/Māori-protocols
- Toch, H. (1977). *Living in prison: The ecology of survival*. New York: Free Press.
- Tuastad, L., & O'Grady, L. (2013). Music therapy inside and outside prisons—A freedom practice? *Nordic Journal of Music Therapy*. Advance online publication doi:10.1080/0809813.1.2012.752760
- Unit for the Arts and Offenders (2003). *Arts in Criminal Justice Settings: Research and Evaluation 15 Case Studies*.
- Ward, T., & Brown, M. (2004). The good lives model and conceptual issues in offender rehabilitation. *Psychology, Crime & Law*, 10(3), 243-257.
- Warfield, D. (2010). Bowing in the right Direction: Highland Mountain Correctional Centre Women's String Orchestra Programme. *International Journal of Community Music* 3 (1): 103-110. Doi: 10.1386/ijcm.3.1.103/7.
- Weiss, C. H. (1979). The many meanings of research utilization. *Public Administration Review*, 39: 426-431.
- Weiss, C. H. (1998). Have we learned anything new about the use of evaluation? *American Journal of Evaluation*, 19: 21-33.
- Wilson, D., Caulfield, L., & Atherton, S. (2008). Good Vibrations: The Long-Term Impact on a Prison-based Music Project. *Prison Service Journal*. Issue 182: 27-32.
- Wilson, D., Caulfield, L., & Atherton, S. (2009). Good vibrations: the long-term impact of a prison-based music project. *Prison Service Journal*, 182: 27-32.

Wolcott, Harry F. (2001). *The art of fieldwork*. Walnut Creek, CA: AltaMira Press.

Woodward, S. C., Sloth-Nielson, J., & Mathiti, V. ((2008). South Africa, the arts and youth in conflict with the law. *International Journal of Community Music*, 1 (1): 69-88.

Yin, R. K. (1994). *Case Study Research: Design and methods*. (2nd Edition). Beverly Hills, CA: Sage.

Yin, R. K. (2014). *Case Study Research: Design and methods*. Los Angeles, CA: Sage.

Appendices

Evaluation methodology

Evaluation purpose, objectives and key questions

Purpose

For the Christchurch Symphony Orchestra's (CSO) Senior Management Team, there is a two-fold purpose to the Platform Programme evaluation:

- To gain a baseline understanding about the activities and impact of the Platform Programme for the participants and the wider community to provide accountability for stakeholders and inform future investment and operational decisions about the programme's direction, goals and allocation of resources.
- To provide empirical knowledge about the success factors and areas for further development of the programme that facilitate decisions about strategic actions to further strengthen the Community Engagement Programme.

These purposes have uses that are instrumental, accountable and enlightening. Instrumental in that the findings will be used to make decisions to strengthen the programme (Greene, 1988; Shulha & Cousins, 1997). Accountable in that the findings may provide evidence

about the value of the programme for stakeholders, including the programme participants, the community and funding bodies (Alkin & Taut, 2003; Weiss, 1998). Enlightening in that the findings will add knowledge to the empirical literature in the arts (Weiss, 1979).

Objectives

The evaluation objectives include:

- 1** To understand the outcomes of the CSO Platform Programme for the Tū Ora, the musicians and the wider Christchurch community.
- 2** To surface the success factors associated with the CSO Platform Programme to increase stakeholders' knowledge and understanding about the practices and processes that are effective within the correctional context.
- 3** To add to the 'what works' empirical literature about the use of orchestral music and instruments within correctional settings.



Key questions

To meet the evaluation objectives several key questions have been developed.

Objectives and key questions

Objectives	Key questions
<p>To understand the outcomes of the Platform Programme for the Tū Ora, the musicians and the wider Christchurch community</p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1 <i>To what extent did the CSO Platform Programme enhance the wellbeing of the Tū Ora and bring about positive changes in their lives?</i> 2 <i>What did the musicians gain from participating in the CSO Platform Programme?</i> 3 <i>What are the outcomes for the wider Christchurch community of including the CSO Platform Programme in their community engagement programme?</i> 4 <i>What is the participants' level of satisfaction with the CSO Platform Programme?</i> 5 <i>To what extent are the CSO Platform Programme's goals achieved?</i>
<p>To surface the success factors associated with the CSO Platform Programme to increase stakeholders' knowledge and understanding about the practices and processes that are effective within the correctional context.</p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 6 <i>What is working well?</i> 7 <i>What implementation factors contributed to the outcomes sought?</i> 8 <i>What are the musicians and the Tū Ora perceptions of the CSO Platform Programme?</i> 9 <i>What new ideas emerged that were tried and tested during the implementation of the eight-weeks of the CSO Platform Programme?</i> 10 <i>What opportunities are there for further development of the CSO Platform Programme?</i>
<p>To add to the 'what works' empirical literature about the use of orchestral music and instruments within correctional settings.</p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 11 <i>What is the programme theory of the CSO Platform Programme?</i> 12 <i>Did the programme theory of the CSO Platform Programme align with and/or differ from current empirical evidence in the literature?</i> 13 <i>What lessons can be learned from the evaluation of the CSO Platform Programme?</i>

Evaluation design and approaches

The case study was the key design used for this evaluation – a design that explored in-depth a complex real-life situation as a composite whole using multiple sources of evidence (Yin, 1994). This case study design was supplemented by several approaches tailored to match the context in which the evaluation took place including:

- Programme theory approach.
- Tikanga Māori approach.
- Participatory approach.

Case study design

A qualitative case study design was chosen to examine the CSO Platform Programme because little is known about this programme's implementation and outcomes and more is needed to explore, seek understanding and establish meaning of the experiences from the perspectives of those involved (Merriam, 2009; Simons, 2009; Stake, 2006; Yin, 2014). The evaluation is largely exploratory and explanatory in that it intended to surface the resources used and activities undertaken by the participants and to begin to explore the contributory relationships between them and the outcomes achieved (Flyvbjerg, 2011; Merriam, 2009; Simons, 2009; Stake, 2006; Stewart, 2014; Yin, 2014). Selecting a single, holistic case (the CSO Platform Programme) facilitated at the Christchurch Men's Prison over an eight-week period during August and September 2019 enabled the evaluation team to focus and manage data collection and analysis within the resources available; reveal phenomenon hitherto unexplained; and test and add strength to programme theory developed from the empirical literature (Cepeda & Martin, 2005).

Programme theory approach

Integrating a programme theory approach into the CSO Platform Programme evaluation was based on its proven effectiveness in evaluating programmes in the real-world using case study designs (Creswell, 2014; Kalu & Norman, 2018; Stern, 2015; White, 2009). Programme theory models (alternatively known as intervention logic models) include a chain of results from inputs, activities, outputs and outcomes (short, medium, and long-term outcomes) that show the links between the causes and effects of a programme. They are designed to answer questions about the

outcomes of a programme (by assessing the changes brought about by the programme for the participants) and questions about how it worked (by examining the processes that resulted in those changes). Moreover, they consider external factors in the environment that may impact on a programme's ability to produce results (Hernandez, 2000; Millar, Simeone & Carnevale, 2001).

Within the context of this evaluation, a programme theory of change was developed from the empirical literature and depicted graphically; and data was collected at the different levels of the programme theory model (inputs, activities, outputs, etc.) to establish whether, and how, the CSO Platform Programme resulted in the desired outcomes.

The advantages of using a programme theory model for the CSO Platform Programme include:

- Helps reach consensus about the goals of the programme.
- Builds an understanding of the complexities of the programme.
- In the future, it will help the CSO Senior Management Team track progress by providing a framework to monitor the implementation and results of the programme.

Tikanga Māori approach

In line with the kaupapa Māori framework operating in the Navigate Initiative – Reintegrative Community in the Leimon Villa in which the Tū Ora reside and the Department of Corrections kaupapa Māori values that underpin the strategic plan, Ara Poutama – Pathway Trust to Excellence, this evaluation adopted a tikanga Māori approach. This kaupapa Māori approach used tikanga to create a culturally safe environment for Tū Ora and their whānau to engage with the researcher from Ihi Research. In particular, the interactions between the researcher and the Tū Ora were based on the values drawn from the Te Tokorima a Maui model developed by the Department of Corrections Māori Service Team including:

- **Rangatira:** We act with integrity in all that we do.
- **Manaaki:** We care about people.
- **Wairua:** We respect other cultures.

- **Whānau:** We support positive relationships.
- **Kaitiaki:** We keep each other safe.²⁴

Creating a spiritually, socially and emotionally safe environment for the interactions between the Ihi Research evaluator and the Tū Ora involved a number of tikanga including whakawhanungatanga (the process of establishing links such as whakapapa links or relationship links); the use of greetings such as kia ora and/or hongī; acknowledging the mana of others; and from a te ao Māori perspective creating a level playing field. As a relationship of trust and respect between the researcher and the Tū Ora grew, the Tū Ora referred to the researcher as matua - a reference to the position of seniority and showing of respect.

The researcher contacted the whānau before meetings to establish whanaungatanga and define where they were going to meet; who was visiting; and what was unique about the visit. The whānau met with the researcher in their own spaces and on their own terms. Kai was taken to share with the whānau as a way of removing the tapu that keeps people separate and to pave the way for a good discussion. Through such actions, whānau felt they could express themselves openly and they felt safe (Tipene et al., 2009).

The participant observation and the interview methods and the analysis of the data were undertaken by a Māori researcher who communicated in a mana-enhancing manner with reference to the Te Whare Tapa Whā model – a model which takes the whole person into account including whānau (relationships), wairua (sense of self), tīnana (physical) and hinengaro (thinking and feeling) (Mental Health Foundation, 2019).

Ihi Research shared the findings in the evaluation report with the Tū Ora and their whānau (Kennedy & Cram, 2010).

Participatory approach

A participatory approach was developed to ensure it was responsive to those with a vested interest in the delivery and impact of the CSO Platform Programme. The evaluation was positioned to produce information

that was useful for the intended users and supported their decisions and actions (Henry & Mark, 2003; Patton, 2008; Gujit, 2014).

As part of this participatory approach and to develop and implement the evaluation plan, Ihi Research and representatives from the CSO senior management team met in July 2019 to explore and decide what they wanted to find out, who and for what purposes they were going to use the evaluation findings, and what could be realistically achieved within the resources available. This meeting involved coming to a mutual understanding about aspects of the evaluation including:

- The purpose of the evaluation.
- The plan for conducting the evaluation, including the key evaluation questions and the types of methods used.
- Identification of key evaluation respondent groups, including participating in the evaluation as respondents.
- Plans to review the draft evaluation report.

There were several reasons for adopting a participatory approach. These included:

- Providing an 'inside' perspective on the requirements of the evaluation project and the ways in which the findings would be used ensured the evaluation work took the right direction and the findings had utility for those commissioning the evaluation.
- Involving people with experience of the CSO and the facilitation of the Platform Programme provided the opportunity to generate information about the appropriate orientation and procedures that matched the context within which the evaluation took place, for example using a participant-observer method within a correctional context.
- Involving people with senior management experience of the CSO Engagement Programme

²⁴These values were sourced from The Navigate Initiative –Reintegration Community (NI-RC) Operational Framework developed to support the partnership and co-design process for the 24-month pilot from September 2018 between the Department of Corrections, Pathway Trust, Drug-ARM and Anglican Care.

enabled the collection of accurate data about the activities, results and context within which it has been implemented.

- Involving the CSO Senior Management Team collaboratively in the evaluation process also had the potential to spark creativity by opening doors to new ways of thinking and perspectives on community engagement and ways in which to strengthen it for the participants (Ramirez & Brodhead, 2013; Patton, 2012).

This participatory approach engaged the CSO Senior Management Team, and those responsible for the implementation of the programme (the CSO principal musicians) and the potential beneficiaries of the programme – the men from the Leimon Villas. By involving these participants on their experiences of the CSO Platform Programme and the impact it had on their lives, the evaluation was enriched in the following ways:

- Those implementing the CSO Platform Programme and those directly affected by it were most capable of sorting out effective programme elements and explaining why particular techniques or approaches were appropriate, responsive and effective.²⁵
- It provided a feedback loop for the CSO principal musicians by offering insights into how they were perceived by those accessing the programme; the effective aspects of programme provision that they experienced; and, identified areas of the programme that could be considered for improvement (Weinstein, 2010:164).

Evaluation methods and procedures

The evaluation study adopted a multiple methods approach to maximise the comprehensiveness of the information collected to answer the evaluation questions. The principle evaluation methods used included:

- The synthesis of the pertinent international and national literature (secondary data).

- The synthesis of administrative records (secondary data).
- In-depth face-to-face individual and group interviews and in-depth individual telephone interviews (primary data).
- Participant observation (primary data).

Green and Caracelli (1997a, 1997b) and others (Green, Benjamin & Goodyear, 2001; Sieber, 1998) maintain that the combination of different methods provides a way to gain several layers of understanding about the subject of the evaluation and a strategy to clarify the results of the evaluation – an approach that introduces complementarity to the collection and collation of the data.²⁶ Moreover, the use of multiple methods enables both methods triangulation (using different methods) as well as data triangulation (using different sources of data, for example collecting data from people with different perspectives on the subject of the evaluation) – an approach that enables an analysis of the convergence and/or cross validation of the findings to enhance credibility (Bentahar & Cameron, 2015; Denzin, 1978; Greene, Caracelli & Graham, 1989; Yauch & Steudel, 2003).

Procedures for data collection and analysis

Synthesis of the literature

The literature review involved a systematic search for and review of international and New Zealand published and unpublished research, evaluation studies and policy and programme documents. The review was not exhaustive of all available data sources, as this could not be achieved in the timeframe for the evaluation. The review only included studies completed in a correctional setting and with music experiences. Combinations of relevant terms were used to source the data for the literature review including: 'symphony orchestras and corrections;' 'symphony orchestra and corrections and outcomes;' 'orchestral music and corrections;' 'orchestral instruments and corrections;' 'evidence base and symphony orchestra and prison;' 'success factors and symphony orchestra and corrections;' 'orchestral music and corrections;' and 'evaluation and symphony orchestra.'

²⁵Ramon (2000) argues that involving those responsible for implementing the service and those who are beneficiaries of the service "leads to a generation of new and more in-depth knowledge, more truthful information from participants" and a better understanding by evaluators of the lives of service beneficiaries.

The review describes common or divergent findings across information sources and is presented in thematic form around the following categories:

- Outcomes from using music and instruments from a symphony orchestra in a correctional environment, including psychological, behavioural, relational and social outcomes.
- Success factors that contribute to the effectiveness of using music and instruments from a symphony orchestra within a correctional environment.

Developing a programme theory/logic model

A programme theory was developed during the planning stages of this evaluation to merge existing evidence (from the empirical literature) about what works for music and symphony orchestras within a correctional context. It is a conceptual framework represented as a chain of results (inputs, activities, outputs, and short, medium and long-term outcomes) that produce the intended impact. In summary, programme theories form a foundation upon which to understand what impacts occurred or failed to occur and helps make more explicit our knowledge about the mechanisms of change operating within the CSO Platform Programme (Weiss, 1995; Weiss, 1997).

The procedure for collecting and analysing the primary data

Reviewing the interview schedules Draft interview schedules were reviewed to check the cultural appropriateness of the questions; identify and remove any ambiguities within questions to maximise respondents' understanding; omit any redundant questions or add others to ensure all information sought was covered; and rearrange some questions to facilitate the logical progression of themes within each interview schedule.

Initial email contact The evaluators initially made email contact with prospective respondents to introduce the evaluation, invite their participation and send out the Participant Information Sheet and the Consent Form. The initial contact was to ascertain their

willingness and consent to participate. Once consent was given, mutually suitable dates, times and places for the face-to-face and telephone interviews were established.

Individual key respondent face-to-face and telephone interviews and group interviews

Ten face-to-face interviews and two telephone interviews were conducted with 12 respondents during October, November and December 2019. These respondents were purposefully selected on the basis they possessed a body of knowledge, experience and diversity of perspectives on the CSO Platform Programme. The respondents included representation from Pathway Trust (management and Tū Ora Navigators), CSO (Senior Management Team and the principal musicians who facilitated the CSO Platform Programme), Department of Corrections and the Tū Ora's whānau. Variability was maximised to gather multiple perspectives on the CSO Platform Programme's outcomes and the inputs and activities that contributed to the programme's effectiveness.

Structured data collection instruments guided the interviews. The interview schedules included mostly open-ended questions to gain an understanding of the range of perspectives and experiences held by the respondents about the programme.

All the Tū Ora who participated in the CSO Platform Programme were invited to participate in a group interview. Seven participants were willing and available to be involved in two group interviews with the evaluator – three in one group interview and four in the other group interview.²⁷ These interviews were conducted at the end of September 2019.

All interviews were transcribed, and the respondents' responses were coded in thematically orientated categories.

Participant observation Participant observation is the process of learning through ... involvement in the ... routine activities of the participants in the research setting (Schensul, Schensul & LeCompt, 1999). The aim of participant observation is to assist with developing a holistic understanding of the CSO Platform Programme that is objective and accurate. It is used to increase the validity of the study.²⁸

²⁸Complementarity is defined as an epistemological design to understand human behaviour through the use of separate but dialectically related research approaches (Carroll & Rothe, 2010:3479). It is used to confirm, overturn or extend findings from evaluation and research.

In the participant as observer stance, the evaluator became a member of the group learning about the instruments and learning music like the Tū Ora, and both the Tū Ora and the CSO principle musicians were aware of his role as a participant observer evaluator. The evaluator conducted the observations in the following manner:

- Specified the day, date and time and included relevant background information to provide context for each session with the CSO principal musicians.
- Paid attention to a single activity and/or interaction while gaining an overall perspective of the situation.
- Looked at the interactions between participants in each session, including who talks to who and how decisions are made.
- Listened carefully to conversations to remember verbatim statements made by the participants (DeWalt & DeWalt, 2002; Merriam, 1998; Schensul, Schensul & LeCompt, 1999; Wolcott, 2001).

The evaluator noted his observations after each day of participant observation.

The advantages of including participant observation in this study include:

- It provides a rich detailed description of the CSO Platform Programme in action, together with the actions and reactions of the participants.
- It improves the quality of data collection (for example, records behaviours without having to rely on respondents' memories to report what they did) and interpretation (DeMunck & Sobo, 1998; De Walt & DeWalt, 2002).

Letters of thanks Those who participated as respondents in the evaluation project received letters of thanks.

Data analysis

Information from the individual and group key respondent interviews and records from the participant observation were coded. Each type of response within each response category was tabulated and grouped. The organised data was interpreted and synthesised into general conclusions and understandings. These results were complemented with examples that describe each different response grouping, including the use of quotes.

The procedure for collecting and analysing the secondary data

The evaluation was informed by the collection and analysis of primary data and secondary data which provided contextual information. Secondary data included:

- A review of the organisational and service-focused documents and data, including information taken from the respective websites of the CSO, Pathway Trust and the Department of Corrections.

Ethical considerations

To counter potential ethical issues, including concerns about the respondents' wellbeing, a number of preventative measures were established.

Sharing the purpose of the evaluation: All respondents were informed about the purpose of the evaluation and provided with sufficient information to answer any queries. This was important for the participant observation where participants were advised that the purpose of participation was to document their activities.

Informed consent: All potential respondents were advised in the Participant Information Sheet of the purpose and nature of the evaluation so they could choose whether to be involved or not. Informed consent was sought from all potential respondents. The evaluation was conducted within the premise that it is each individual's right to decide whether, and how to, contribute information. Their judgement on these

²⁷The other three Tū Ora were unavailable to participate in the group interviews because of prior commitments to work programmes, parole hearings, etc.

²⁸Validity in this context includes face validity and context validity (Lincoln & Guba, 1994).

matters was respected and respondents were invited to ask questions at any time.

Freedom to withdraw: Participation in this evaluation was voluntary and respondents were free to withdraw at any time and/or refuse to answer any questions or be observed without negative consequence.

Confidentiality: The anonymity of the respondents was maintained. Notes from the interviews and observations will only be viewed by the Ihi Research team and do not have any names attached with names replaced by a code number. All written material was securely locked in a filing cabinet or a password protected file. Information collected from individuals was collated and presented in aggregate form. There was no reference to the names of particular individuals or places which could be used as identifiers, except where permission was given.

Conflicting interests: Evaluation that is conducted within a contestable environment is bound to be confronted with conflicting interests. For example, there may be subtle pressure to ignore evidence or suppress negative results. To counter this ethical issue, the evaluation was conducted without bias and the results have been disseminated in a sensitive manner.

Storage and use of data: Data collected during the evaluation has been securely stored by the evaluator

to ensure the material is only used for the purpose for which it was gathered. Respondents were advised the data is for the purpose of gathering information about the impact, success factors and areas of improvement of the CSO Platform Programme. Written material used in the evaluation will be destroyed after one-year.

Promises to supply information fulfilled: All requests by respondents for copies of their interview notes have been met and the draft evaluation report was shared with participants to ensure the accuracy of the findings.

Wellbeing of informants: The evaluation may have exposed the vulnerabilities of some of the respondents. To counter this ethical issue, the evaluation was conducted in a sensitive manner to respect human dignity and worth. The Tū Ora Navigators and the Department of Correction's staff provided support to the Tū Ora.

Guided by Ethical Standards for Evaluation: The evaluation was conducted in a robust manner and complied with the Aotearoa New Zealand Evaluation Association 'Evaluation Standards' which aims to promote excellence in evaluations conducted in Aotearoa New Zealand focusing on the maintenance of appropriate ethical standards for members of the profession.



The Songs and Poems Written by the Tū Ora

Acknowledgements

We would like to acknowledge the Tū Ora and thank them for granting us permission to include the following songs and poems, which were composed during the course of the programme and performed as part of the final concert.

Creation

Dreaming of how creation came to be
While I stood under Ranginui
My skin dry and old
I want to tell you how age has taken its toll
Why did Jenny Shipley put the drinking age down?
Baby, you know where our kids will be found
Don't justify what she has done,
because I had to go and pick up our son
You know I used to drink and be violent too
But it's not what I would like you to go through
I dream of a better life
United as one with my son and wife

Song

Dreaming of my mum
While I stood under the shining sun
My skin golden brown as I thought of my mum
How I wanted to tell her how much I had changed
Why this time will be different than all the other days
Baby, you know what it takes to be a mum
because I have a baby son
So, don't even go there, my mum's the one
because I am so proud to be her son
I have seen what she had to go through because of me
She still never ever gave up on me
I do dream of the day when I walk through that golden gate
That big smile on my mum's face as she waits
For every tear that falls, a memory must take its place
for a moment in time as the tear rolls down your face
It may be happy or sad too
But the memory will always come back to you.

My Song

Intro: C Am F G
(C) Dreaming of a rainbow
(C) I stood by a pot of gold
(A) My skin full of goosebumps, covered in tattoos
(C) And I want to tell you how,
(A) you make me feel
(F) and why I do the things I do
(G) Baby, you know it's true
(C) Don't bring me down, or push me out
(G) because I ain't a fool
(C) I've seen the way you've been acting rude
(Am) and I've had enough of your attitude
(C) You know I used to love you so
(Am) But it's not the same, I gotta let you go
(F) I dreamed of a rainbow
(G) standing in a pot of gold
Outro: (C) (G) (C)



ihi

Research

Social Change
& Innovation